

# AZAB AL-QABR

by

Abu Shahiryaar

2023

ISLAMIC-BELIEF.NET

# AZAB AL-QABR

BY

Abu Shahiryaa

2023

Published by [www.islamic-belief.net](http://www.islamic-belief.net)

Copyright ©–2023 Abu Shahiryar

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be produced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying recording or any information storage and retrieval system, without the prior written permission of the publisher. For permissions contact **[islamic-belief@live.co.uk](mailto:islamic-belief@live.co.uk)**

If you notice any error in translation or text please inform at **[islamic-belief@live.co.uk](mailto:islamic-belief@live.co.uk)**



# AZAB AL-QABR

بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ

الْحَمْدُ لِلَّهِ نَسْتَعِينُهُ وَنَسْتَغْفِرُهُ وَنَعُوذُ بِاللَّهِ مِنْ مُرُورِ أَنْفُسِنَا مَنْ  
يَهْدِهِ اللَّهُ فَلَا مُضِلَّ لَهُ وَمَنْ يَضِلَّ فَلَا هَادِيَ لَهُ وَأُقْبَهُدُ أَنْ لَا إِلَهَ  
إِلَّا اللَّهُ وَأُقْبَهُدُ أَنْ مُحَمَّدًا عَبْدُهُ وَرَسُولُهُ

All the praise be to Allah, we seek his help and apologize to him and find refuge in him from the mischief of ourselves and whom Allah guided none can mislead him and whom he sent astray none can guide him and I witness that there is no God except Allah and that Muhammad is his slave and prophet.

No doubt it is a fact that there would be torment or pleasure after death. However, the majority of Muslims now believe that this would happen in the earthly abode of a dead body commonly called a grave. The concept of Azab-al-Qabr is clearly explained in Quran and Sahih ahadith that everyone would experience one death on this earth and that the soul once taken out of the body would not be returned to the body till the day of resurrection. The body meanwhile would disintegrate and degenerates into dust. The torment or pleasure of any kind would be experienced by the soul in a new body.

Some scholars have made up a belief that the torment from death till resurrection happens in this earthly grave. First, the soul would be returned to the body in the grave for questioning and in case of a wrong outcome the body would experience hell fire in the grave and the soul would be taken back to Hell. There is no valid hadith for this belief and in reality, this belief is conjured from a mixture of non-authentic narrations, as will be explained in this treatise.

The purpose of the grave is to hide the dead as the body would go into disintegration. It would rot and be consumed by the insects and finally goes to dust. In Quran, this purpose is first explained

when Qabeel (son of Prophet Adam peace be upon him) killed his brother. In surah Al-Maidah (5:27-31) we are informed that:

*And (O Muhammad ) recite to them (the Jews) the story of the two sons of Adam [Habil (Abel) and Qabil (Cain)] in truth; when each offered a sacrifice (to Allah), it was accepted from the one but not from the other. The latter said to the former: "I will surely kill you. " The former said: "Verily, Allah accepts only from those who are the pious". "If you do stretch your hand against me to kill me, I shall never stretch my hand against you to kill you, for I fear Allah; the Lord of the all Universe." "Verily, I intend to let you draw my sin on yourself as well as yours, then you will be one of the dwellers of the Fire, and that is the recompense of the wrong-doers." So the self of the latter one encouraged him and made fair-seeming to him the murder of his brother. He murdered him and became one of the losers. Then Allah sent a crow who scratched the ground to show him to hide the dead body of his brother. He (the murderer) said: "Woe to me! Am I not even able to be like this crow and hide the dead body of my brother?" Then he became one of those who regretted it.*

Prophet also explained that all bodies would be disintegrated. Imam Bukhari , juz 16, pg 333, chapter باب ( يَوْمَ يُنْفَخُ فِي الصُّورِ فَنَأْتُونَ أَفْوَاجًا ) رُفِعَا reported that:

حَدَّثَنِي مُحَمَّدٌ أَخْبَرَنَا أَبُو مُعَاوِيَةَ عَنِ الْأَعْمَشِ  
عَنْ أَبِي صَالِحٍ عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ - رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ -  
قَالَ قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ - صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ - مَا  
يَبْنُ النَّفْسَتَيْنِ أَرْبَعُونَ . قَالَ أَرْبَعُونَ يَوْمًا قَالَ  
أَبْنَيْتُ . قَالَ أَرْبَعُونَ شَهْرًا قَالَ أَبْنَيْتُ . قَالَ أَرْبَعُونَ  
سَنَةً قَالَ أَبْنَيْتُ . قَالَ ثُمَّ يَنْزِلُ اللَّهُ مِنَ السَّمَاءِ مَاءً

فَيَنْبُتُونَ كَمَا يَنْبُتُ الْبَقْلُ لَيْسَ مِنَ الْإِنْسَانِ شَيْءٌ إِلَّا يَبْلَى إِلَّا عَظْمًا وَاحِدًا وَهُوَ عَجْبُ الذَّنْبِ ، وَمِنْهُ يَرْكَبُ الْحَلْقُ يَوْمَ الْقِيَامَةِ

*Abu Huraira - may Allah be pleased with him - said the Messenger of Allah - peace be upon him said- «What between forty Al-Nafkateen (two blowings of Cnoch) . (Inquirer asked) Forty days? he said can't say this. Forty months? said can't say this. Forty years? said can't say this. Abu Huraira said (I heard from Prophet that) «Then God will send down water from the sky and they (humans) grow to like (plant) grows. There would be nothing in human but fret only one bone (remains) that is the tailbone, and on it ride the creation on the Day of Resurrection.*

Bukhari has shown that all human bodies would be consumed by Earth except the tailbone. This shows that the body is nothing with out a soul. The earth even consumes the bodies of Holy Prophets as informed in the narration of Abi-Yala, juz 13, pg 189:

حدثنا أبو هشام الرفاعي محمد بن يزيد حدثنا ابن فضيل عن يونس بن عمرو عن أبي بردة : عن أبي موسى قال : أتى النبي - صلى الله عليه وسلم - أعرابيا فأكرمه فقال له : ائتنا فأثنا فقال رسول الله - صلى الله عليه وسلم - : سل حاجتك فقال : ناقة نركبها وأعتنا يحملها أهلي فقال رسول الله - صلى الله عليه وسلم - : عجزتم أن تكونوا مثل عجوز بني إسرائيل ؟ قال : إن موسى لما سار ببني إسرائيل من مصر ضلوا الطريق فقال : ما هذا ؟ فقال علماءهم : إن يوسف لما حضره الموت أخذ علينا موثقا من الله أن لا نخرج من مصر حتى ننقل عظامه معنا قال : فمن يعلم موضع قبره ؟ قال : عجوز من بني إسرائيل فبعث إليها فأثته فقال : دليني على قبر يوسف قالت : حتى تعطيني حكمي قال : ما

حكمت ؟ قالت : أكون معك في الجنة فكره أن يعطيها ذلك فأوحى الله إليه أن أعطاها حكمها فانطلقت بهم إلى بحيرة : موضع مستنقع ماء فقالت : أنضبوا هذا الماء فأنضبوا قالت : احتفروا واستخرجوا عظام يوسف فلما أفلوها إلى الأرض إذا الطريق مثل ضوء النهار

*Prophet said: When Moses exited along Beni Israel from Egypt he strayed path and said: What is this? Scholars said: Prophet Joseph has took us an oath in God that we would not go out of Egypt, unless we take his bones with us. Moses said: Who knows where his (Joseph's) grave is? They said: An elderly woman of the children of Israel (knew about it), he (Moses) reached her and said: Inform me about the grave of Joseph. She said: Give me a verdict (Promise) He inquired: What's your verdict (Promise)? She said: I (want to be) with you in paradise. He abhorred to give this promise to her until God revealed to him (Moses) to give her this verdict. (Finally) They reached with them to a Lake: The place of swamp water, she said: take out this water. They took out the water and extracted the bones of Joseph when bones reached to the ground the road was (visible) like daylight.*

This hadith indicates that even the Prophets' bodies would be disintegrated by the earth. Quran informs us that Prophet Bodies would not last forever. Allah informed us in Quran, surah Al-Anbiyah (21:8)

وَمَا جَعَلْنَاهُمْ جَسَدًا لَا يَأْكُلُونَ الطَّعَامَ وَمَا كَانُوا خَالِدِينَ

*And We did not create them (the Messengers, with) bodies that ate not food, nor were they (last) forever.*

Therefore, all bodies would be disintegrated irrespective of Prophet, righteous



person, or evildoer. There might be some exceptions, but that could be because of climatic conditions and weather, which is a temporary effect. Bodies may also survive because of embalming or mum-

mification procedures, which are purely scientific methods of preservation. But even these procedures may help for a while and finally, the bodies disintegrate and dust (humans) becomes dust!

### Concept of Death and Sleep

In Quranic Verses

Before we go on and continue our discussion on Azab al-Qabr, it would be necessary to first understand the concept of death in the Quran. In surah az-Zumar (39:42) it is informed that:

اللَّهُ يَتَوَفَّى الْأَنْفُسَ حِينَ مَوْتِهَا وَالَّتِي لَمْ تَمُتْ فِي مَنَامِهَا فِيمُمْسِكُ النَّبِيَّ فَصَىٰ عَلَيْهَا الْمَوْتَ وَيُرْسِلُ الْأُنْحَرَىٰ إِلَىٰ أَجَلٍ مُّسَمًّى إِنَّ فِي ذَٰلِكَ لَآيَاتٍ لِّقَوْمٍ يَتَفَكَّرُونَ (٤٢)

*Allah seizes (humans) souls at the time of their death, and He seizes (soul) which die not (yet) in its sleep. He keeps the (soul) for which He has ordained death and release the rest till an appointed term. Lo! Herein verily are portents for people who take thought.*

In surah al-Anam (6:60-61) it is explained that:

وَهُوَ الَّذِي يَتَوَفَّاكُم بِاللَّيْلِ وَيَعْلَمُ مَا جَرَحْتُم بِالنَّهَارِ ثُمَّ يَبْعَثُكُمْ فِيهِ لِيُقْضَىٰ أَجَلٌ مُّسَمًّى ثُمَّ إِلَيْهِ مَرْجِعُكُمْ ثُمَّ يُنَبِّئُكُم بِمَا كُنتُمْ تَعْمَلُونَ (٦٠) وَهُوَ الْقَاهِرُ فَوْقَ عِبَادِهِ وَيُرْسِلُ عَلَيْكُمْ حَفَظَةً حَتَّىٰ إِذَا جَاءَ أَحَدَكُمْ الْمَوْتُ تَوَفَّنَا مُسْلِمًا وَهُمْ لَا يَقْرَءُونَ (٦١)

*He is Who seizes you at night and knows that which you commit by day. Then He raises you again to life that the term appointed (for you) may be*

*accomplished. And afterward unto Him is your return. Then He will proclaim unto you what ye used to do. He is the Omnipotent over His slaves. He sends guardians over you until, when death comes unto one of you, Our messengers receive him, and they neglect not.*

There are two important words in these verses. One is Tawaffa (تَوَفَّى) and the other is Rasala (رَسَلَ). Twaffa (تَوَفَّى) in Arabic means taking something. In the Quran, it is used when God informed us that on the day of Judgment, He Almighty would reward us completely. There the words Twaffa kullu Nafas are used. Hence the word Twaffa does not always mean death. Also, God said to Prophet Isa:

إِذْ قَالَ اللَّهُ يَا عِيسَىٰ ابْنِ مَرْيَمَ إِنِّي مُتَوَفِّيكَ وَرَافِعُكَ إِلَيَّ  
When Allah said: O Isa I would take you and lift you towards me.

Here the word مُتَوَفِّيكَ is used, which does not necessarily means death. Therefore in the same sense, the word تَوَفَّى Tawaffa is used in chapters 6 and 39 for sleep. The sleeping person has all kinds of vital signs i.e. breathing, sweating, dreaming, etc. The soul is seized or held completely in the body. Sleep could be called a minor death in this sense. Death as a phenomenon involves the complete hold of the soul. After death, all vital signs will be absent. Another important word is



Rasala (رسل) which has two meanings: one is sending and another is releasing. Bukhari Hadith (juz 1, pg 4) explained this when the angel arrived in the cave of Hira and asked Prophet to read.

فأخذني فغطني حتى بلغ مني الجهد ثم أرسلني  
فقال اقرأ قلت ما أنا بقارئ

*He (angel) took me and (squeezed) until he reached my limit and then released me and said read, I said, I am not a reader!*

These two examples help us to understand the meaning of verses (6:60-61) and (39:42). The soul is seized in the body at the time of death and sleep. Allah released the soul of living and does not return the soul of death. The words *إِذَا جَاءَ أَحَدَكُمْ الْمَوْتُ تَوَفَّتْهُ رُسُلُنَا* also indicate that unlike sleep at death the task is done via angels.

Some people try to insert confusion into the meaning of Death and Sleep. According to them, the sleeping phenomenon is like the death phenomenon, and accordingly, a person experiences thousands of deaths when he or she sleeps over his or her life time. This is an ignorant and deviated understanding of these verses concocted to fulfill some ulterior motives.

The body would feel any kind of torment until there is a soul in it. Allah

has revealed in Quran that the people of Hell would cry for death and ask Malik—the Manager of Hell to grant them death. Mentioned in surah al-Dukkhan:

لَا يَذُوقُونَ فِيهَا الْمَوْتَ إِلَّا الْمَوْتَةَ الْأُولَىٰ وَوَقَاهُمْ  
عَذَابَ الْحَرِيمِ (٥٦)

*They will never taste death therein except the first death (of this world), and He will save them from the torment of the blazing Fire.*

Mentioned in surah Al-Furqan:

لَا تَدْعُوا الْيَوْمَ ثُبُورًا وَاحِدًا وَادْعُوا ثُبُورًا كَثِيرًا  
(١٤)

*Exclaim not today for one destruction, but exclaim for many destructions.*

Mentioned in surah Al-Fatir:

وَالَّذِينَ كَفَرُوا لَهُمْ نَارُ جَهَنَّمَ لَا يُقْضَىٰ عَلَيْهِمْ  
فِيمُوتُوا وَلَا يُخَفَّفُ عَنْهُمْ مِنْ عَذَابِهَا كَذَلِكَ نَجْزِي  
كُلَّ كَافِرٍ

*But those who disbelieve, (in the Oneness of Allah - Islamic Monotheism) for them will be the Fire of Hell. Neither it will have a complete killing effect on them so that they die, nor shall its torment be lightened for them. Thus do We requite every disbeliever!*

These verses indicate that death would eliminate all sense of torment or bliss.

## Number of deaths and lives

For a human

Quran explicitly informs us that each breathing person would experience two deaths and two lives. Quran says in surah Al-Baqarh (2:28)

كَيْفَ تَكْفُرُونَ بِاللَّهِ وَكُنْتُمْ أَمْوَاتًا فَأَحْيَاكُمْ ثُمَّ  
يُمِيتُكُمْ ثُمَّ يُحْيِيكُمْ ثُمَّ إِلَيْهِ تُرْجَعُونَ

*How can you disbelieve in Allah? Seeing that you were dead and He gave you life. Then He will give you death, then again will bring you to life (on the Day of*

*Resurrection), and then unto Him you will return.*

Further, it is explained that people of hell would call their Lord ( Al-Ghafir 40:11)

قَالُوا رَبَّنَا أَمَتْنَا اثْنَتَيْنِ وَأَحْيَيْتَنَا اثْنَتَيْنِ فَاعْتَرَفْنَا  
بِدُنُوبِنَا فَهَلْ إِلَى خُرُوجٍ مِنْ سَبِيلٍ

*They will say: "Our Lord! You have made us die twice, and You have given us life! Now we confess our sins, then is there any way to get out (of the Fire)?"*

Imam Tibiri explained this in his exegesis on the Quran جامع البيان في تأويل القرآن as:

### Meaning of Qabr

For a human body and soul

In Surah Al-Abbasa Allah informs us that every person would get a grave:

قُتِلَ الْإِنْسَانُ مَا أَكْفَرَهُ (١٧) مِنْ أَيِّ شَيْءٍ خَلَقَهُ  
(١٨) مِنْ نُطْفَةٍ خَلَقَهُ فَقَدَرَهُ (١٩) ثُمَّ السَّبِيلِ  
يَسَّرَهُ (٢٠) ثُمَّ أَمَاتَهُ فَأَقْبَرَهُ (٢١) ثُمَّ إِذَا شَاءَ  
أَنْشَرَهُ (٢٢)

*Be cursed (the disbelieving) man! How ungrateful he is! From what thing did He create him? From Nutfah (male and female semen drops) He created him, and then set him in due proportion; Then He makes the Path easy for him; Then He causes him to die, and puts him in his grave; Then, when it is His Will, He will resurrect him (again).*

The above verses describe the acts of God with humans. As they go through different stages from conception to resurrection. All humans would experi-

حدثني يعقوب بن إبراهيم، قال: حدثنا هُشَيْمٌ، عن حصين، عن أبي مالك، في قوله: *مَمَتْنَا اثْنَتَيْنِ وَأَحْيَيْتَنَا اثْنَتَيْنِ*، قال: كانوا أمواتًا

فأحياهم الله، ثم أماتهم، ثم أحياهم

*Abi Malik Al-Ghafiri Al-Kofi said in verse You have made us to die and You have given us life twice that they were dead then Allah gave them life, then they would be dead and then raised (again).*

This shows that each person would experience two deaths and two lives:

**First Death:** is the realm of non-existence

**First Life:** This earthly life now

**Second Death:** The death experienced by a breathing person in this world

**Second Life:** is the next life which would start on the Day of Judgment

ence these stages except a few, like Jesus son of Mary born with Immaculate Conception without male intervention also there were stories in the Quran on the resurrection of a person before the final day of Judgment, which indicate the omnipotence of Almighty Allah. An exception is not a rule rather it's a miracle. Therefore in the above verses it is described that every person would get an abode by Allah commonly called a grave. All humans would experience these stages and hence also received a Qabr!

Those who believe in torment in this earthly grave say that Qabr or grave is made in the earth for the body as Allah commanded his Prophet peace be upon him in surah Taubah, that he should not stand at the grave of Abdullah bin Ubai for the funeral prayer.

*And never (O Muhammad ) pray (funeral prayer) for any of them (hypocrites) who dies, nor stand at his grave. Cer-*

tainly, they disbelieved in Allah and His Messenger and died while they were Fasiqun (rebellious, - disobedient to Allah and His Messenger (9: 84)

The dead would be placed on earth as instructed to us by Allah in surah al-Maidah (5:27-31). However, this is not the place where the body would experience any pleasure or torture. It is not necessary that the Azab al-Qabr must be executed in the very grave of a person. The term Azab al-Qabr is used as it's a normal human practice that the dead are buried.

Scholar Ibn-Aqeel said (Talbis- Iblis by Ibn-Jouzi pg 106):

فإنه لما ورد النعم والعذاب للميت علم أن الإضافة حصلت إلى

الأجساد والقبور تعريفاً كأنه يقول صاحب هذا القبر الروح التي كانت في هذا الجسد منعمة بنعم الجنة معذبة بعذاب النار  
So in fact what had been reported on the bliss and agony of the deceased (one must) know that that al-Idafa (of al-Qabr) refers to the bodies and the graves like an adjective (as if it is meant to be) said (that) person in the grave- (Actually )The soul that was in this body is enjoying the bounty of Heaven (or ) tormented in hell fire.

The statement of Ibn-Aqeel is self-explanatory. The term Azab al-Qabr is used for the torment after death till resurrection as a reference only. It is not necessary that torment must be executed in a grave.

### Azab al-Qabr Torment in grave

Quran informs us about the torment afflicted on the Pharaoh and his army in Surah Younis 90-92.

وَجَاوِزْنَا بِبَنِي إِسْرَائِيلَ الْبَحْرَ فَأَتْبَعَهُمْ فِرْعَوْنُ  
وَجُنُودُهُ بَغْيًا وَعَدُوًّا حَتَّى إِذَا أَدْرَكَهُ الْغَرَقُ قَالَ  
أَمْنْتُ أَنَّهُ لَا إِلَهَ إِلَّا الَّذِي آمَنْتُ بِهِ بَنُو إِسْرَائِيلَ  
وَأَنَا مِنَ الْمُسْلِمِينَ (٩٠) وَالآنَ وَقَدْ عَصَيْتَ قَبْلُ  
وَكُنْتَ مِنَ الْمُفْسِدِينَ (٩١) فَأَلْتِيَوْمَ نَنجِيكَ مِنْدَكِ  
لِتَكُونَ لِمَنْ خَلَقَكَ آيَةً وَإِنَّ كَثِيرًا مِنَ النَّاسِ عَنْ  
آيَاتِنَا لَعَافُونَ (٩٢)

And We took the Children of Israel across the sea, and Fir'aun (Pharaoh) with his hosts followed them in oppression and enmity, till when drowning overtook him, he said: "I believe None has the right to be worshipped but He," in Whom the Children of Israel believe, and I am one

of the Muslims (those who submit to Allah's Will)." Now (you believe) while you refused to believe before and you were one of the Mufsidun (evil-doers, corrupts, etc.). So this day We shall deliver your (dead) body (out from the sea) that you may be a sign to those who come after you! And verily, many among mankind are heedless of Our signs.

Further in surah Ghafir (45-46) Allah said:

فَوَقَاهُ اللَّهُ سَيِّئَاتِ مَا مَكَرُوا وَخَاقَ بَالٍ فِرْعَوْنَ  
سُوءِ الْعَذَابِ (٤٥) النَّارُ يُعْرَضُونَ عَلَيْهَا غُدُوًّا  
وَعَشِيًّا وَيَوْمَ تَقُومُ السَّاعَةُ أَدْخِلُوا آلَ فِرْعَوْنَ أَشَدَّ  
الْعَذَابِ (٤٦)

So Allah saved him from the evils that they plotted (against him), while an evil torment encompassed Fir'aun's (Pharaoh) people. The Fire; they are exposed to it, morning and afternoon, and on the Day when the Hour will be established (it will be said to the angels):

## عذاب القبر

"Cause Fir'aun's (Pharaoh) people to enter the severest torment!"

Also it is stated for the drowned nation of Prophet Noah:

بِمَا خَطِيئَاتِهِمْ أُغْرِقُوا فَأَدْخَلُوا نَارًا فَلَمْ يَجِدُوا لَهُمْ  
مِنْ دُونِ اللَّهِ أَنْصَارًا (٢٥)

*Because of their sins, they were drowned, then were made to enter the Fire, and they found none to help them instead of Allah.*

Both of these nations were drowned in water. None of them got the so-called grave as a final resting place instead we are informed that as soon as they were drowned the torment of Fire is started. Naturally, torment has not happened here on earth, so then where it is ensuing?

Normally the scholar who support believe the returning of the soul to the earthly also present the above verses as evidence of torment for the dead before the day of Judgment. We know that not every person gets the grave as some bodies are burned on a pyre, some are scavenged by birds and some are drowned in the sea. Then how come a person receives this torment (Azab al-Qabr) if he hasn't got the earthly grave?

Further evidence that this torment does not happen in this earthly grave is reflected by the following narrations:

Bukhari (juz 1, pg 165, chapter reported that:

حدثنا مسدد قال حدثنا عبد الوارث عن أبي التياح عن أنس قال : قدم النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم المدينة ففزل أعلى المدينة في حي يقال لهم بنو عمرو بن عوف فأقام النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم فيهم أربع عشرة ليلة ثم أرسل إلى بني النجار فحاضوا وقلدهم السيوف كأنهم أنظر إلى النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم على راحلته وأبو بكر ردفه وملاأ بني النجار حوله حتى ألقى بفناء أبي أيوب

وكان يجب أن يصلي حيث أدركته الصلاة ويصلي في مريض الغنم وأنه أمر ببناء المسجد فأرسل إلى ملاء من بني النجار فقال ( يا بني النجار ثامنوني بمناظكم هذا . قالوا لا والله لا نطلب منته إلا إلى الله فقال أنس فكان فيه ما أقول لكم قبور المشركين وفيه خرب وفيه نخل فأمر النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم بقبور المشركين فنشبت ثم بالحرب فمويت وبالنخل فقطع فصفوا النخل قبله المسجد وجعلوا عضادته الحجارة وجعلوا ينقلون الصخر وهم يرتحزون والنبي صلى الله عليه وسلم معهم وهو يقول اللهم لا خير إلا خير الآخرة \* فاغفر للأتباع والمهاجرة

*Narrated Anas: When the Prophet arrived in Medina he dismounted at 'Awali-Medina amongst a tribe called Banu 'Amr bin 'Auf. He stayed there For fourteen nights. Then he sent for Bani An-Najjar and they came armed with their swords. As if I am looking (just now) as the Prophet was sitting over his Rahila (Mount) with Abu Bakr riding behind him and all Banu An-Najjar around him till he dismounted at the courtyard of Abu Aiyub's house. The Prophet loved to pray wherever the time for the prayer was due even at sheep-folds. Later on, he ordered that a mosque should be built and sent for some people of Banu-An-Najjar and said, "O Banu An-Najjar! Suggest to me the price of this (walled) piece of land of yours." They replied, "No! By Allah! We do not demand its price except Allah." Anas added: There were graves of pagans in it and some of it was un-leveled and there were some date-palm trees in it. The Prophet ordered that the graves of the pagans be dug out and the un-leveled land is level led and the date-palm trees be cut down. (So all that was done). They aligned these cut date-palm trees towards the Qibla of the mosque (as a wall) and they also built two stone side-walls (of the mosque). His companions brought the stones while reciting some poetic verses. The Prophet was with them and he kept on saying, "There is no goodness except that of the Hereafter, O Allah!"*

*So please forgive the Ansars and the emigrants."*

The graves of idolaters were destroyed, which indicates that

there was no torment or punishment in those graves, otherwise, Prophet would not have done so.

Realm of al-Burzakh  
Quran informed us that there is Burzakh (barrier) between the soul and this world:

حَتَّىٰ إِذَا جَاءَ أَحَدَهُمُ الْمَوْتُ قَالَ رَبِّ ارْجِعُونِ  
(٩٩) لَعَلِّي أَعْمَلُ صَالِحًا فِيمَا تَرَكْتُ كَلَّا إِنَّهَا كَلِمَةٌ  
هُوَ قَائِلُهَا وَمِنْ وَرَائِهِم بَرْزَخٌ إِلَىٰ يَوْمِ يُبْعَثُونَ  
(١٠٠)

*Until, when death comes to one of them (those who join partners with Allah), he says: "My Lord! Send me back, "So that I may do good in that which I have left behind!" No! It is but a word that he speaks, and behind them is Barzakh (a barrier) until the Day when they will be resurrected.*

The conversation between the soul and Allah Almighty is reported in the above verses. Where the soul would like to go back? The answer to this question is: Back to Erath!

Scholars have coined the name Al-Burzakh to refer to the realm where the souls would remain from death till resurrection. Ibn-Hajar Asqallani writes in his exegeses on Sahih Bukhari, titled Fathul Bari under the discussion on verse (juz 4, قوله : وَقَوْلُهُ تَعَالَىٰ (وَخَلَقَ يَالِ يَرْعُونَ ) الآية (juz 4, pg 443):

قَالَ الْقُرْطُبِيُّ : الْجُمْهُورُ عَلَىٰ أَنَّ هَذَا الْغَرَضُ يَكُونُ فِي الْبَرْزَخِ ،  
وَهُوَ نَحْوُهُ فِي تَلْبِيَّتِ غَدَابِ الْقَبْرِ

*Al-Qurtubi said: the Majority takes that it (torment to Aal-Firoun) happen in al-Burzakh, and is the proof of the torment of the grave*

In one hadith in Sahih Bukhari, it is reported that Prophet Moses and Prophet Adam argued (Volume 8, Book 77, Number 611).

*Narrated Abu Huraira: The Prophet said, "Adam and Moses argued with each other. Moses said to Adam. 'O Adam! You are our father who disappointed us and turned us out of Paradise.' Then Adam said to him, 'O Moses! Allah favored you with His talk (talked to you directly) and He wrote (the Torah) for you with His Hand. Do you blame me for action which Allah had written in my fate forty years before my creation?' So Adam confuted Moses, Adam confuted Moses," the Prophet added, repeating the Statement three times.*

Question arises that when and where this discussion happened? Ibn Hajar in Fathul Bari said that (juz 18/ pg 461):

أَوْ كَانَ ذَلِكَ بَعْدَ وِفَاةِ مُوسَىٰ فَالتَّمَّتَا فِي الْبَرْزَخِ  
.. or that could be after the death of Moses so they both met in al-Burzakh

Also Ibn- Jauzi proposed that (Fathul Bari juz 4, pg 443)

وَذَكَرَ ابْنُ الْجَوْزِيِّ إِحْتِمَالَ الْبِقَائِيَّتَيْنِ فِي الْبَرْزَخِ  
Ibn Al-jauzi said possible met both in al-Burzakh

Ibn- Qutabah said in Taweel Mukhtalif ul hadith juz 1 pg 43:

قال أبو محمد: ونحن نقول: إنه إذا جاز في المعقول وصح في النظر وبالكتاب والخبر إن الله تعالى يبعث من في القبور بعد أن تكون

## عذاب القبر

الأجساد قد بليت والعظام قد رمت جاز أيضاً في  
المعقول وصح في النظر وبالكتاب والخبر إنهم  
يعذبون بعد المات في البرزخ. فأما الكتاب فإن  
الله تعالى يقول: آ النار يعرضون عليها غدواً  
وعشياً ويوم تقوم الساعة أدخلوا آل فرعون أشد  
العذاب آ فهم يعرضون بعد ماتهم على النار  
غدواً وعشياً قبل يوم القيامة ويوم القيامة  
يدخلون أشد العذاب والله عز وجل يقول: آ  
ولا تحسبن الذين قتلوا في سبيل الله أمواتاً بل  
أحياء عند ربهم يرزقون فرحين بما آتاهم الله من  
فضله ويستبشرون بالذين لم يلحقوا بهم من  
خلفهم إلا خوف عليهم ولا هم يحزنون آ وهذا  
شيء خص الله تعالى به شهداء بدر رحمة الله  
عليهم

*Abu Muhammad said: we say: that is the reasonable and true look and (we know from) book and news that God (will) resurrect people in the graves after the flesh has worn off and the bones disintegrated and (we also know from) reasonable consideration in the book and the news that they were tortured after their death in Burzakh. And in the book Allah Almighty said The Fire; they are exposed to it, morning and afternoon, and on the Day when the Hour will be established (it will be said to the angels): "Cause Fir'aun's (Pharaoh) people to enter the severest torment and He said Think not of those who are killed in the Way of Allah as dead. Nay, they are alive, with their Lord, and they have provision. They rejoice in what Allah has bestowed upon them of His Bounty, rejoicing for the sake of those who have not yet joined them, but are left behind (not yet martyred) that on them no fear shall come, nor shall they grieve. And this is*



*something that Allah has singled out for martyrs of Badr may Allah have mercy*

*on them* This evidence clearly shows that scholars had considered the Burzakh as a realm where torment could be afflicted and Prophets could talk to each other.

Some scholars now claim that Burzakh is a figment of imagination. However, they fail to understand that it is only a term referring to the realm where the soul would remain till the resurrection. According to them, the words رَبِّ ارْجِعُونِ (٩٩) لَعَلِّي أُنْفِلُ صَالِحًا فِيمَا كُنْتُ indicate that the dead person would like to come back to earth and can do good deeds only in the world and not in the grave, therefore, these verses have nothing against the returning of the soul to dead.

However, the same group of scholars who believe in returning of soul to the grave claim that a pious person may recite the Quran in a grave and may still do good deeds. They claim (based on non-authentic ahadith) that after burial soul comes back to a dead body and it says to angels, let me say my prayers. Is it, not the case that Prophet instructed his Ummah (Bukhari Volume 1, Book 8, Number 424) :

حدثنا مسدد قال حدثنا يحيى عن عبيد الله قال  
أخبرني نافع عن ابن عمر عن النبي صلى الله  
عليه وسلم قال : ( اجعلوا في بيوتكم من  
صلاتكم ولا تتخذوها قبوراً )  
*Narrated Ibn 'Umar: The Prophet had  
said, "Offer some of your prayers  
(Nawafil) at home, and do not take your  
houses as graves."*

The Prophet informed his Ummah that there are no prayers in a grave.

## New body for a soul in Realm of al-Burzakh

A question naturally arise about how the torment is afflicted if it does not happen in the grave? There are several evidence that the soul is transferred to another body that experiences all these afflictions.

**Evidence 1: Souls with cheeks and head?** It is reported in Sahih al-Bukhari *juz 1/pg 465*

حدثنا موسى بن إسماعيل حدثنا جرير بن حازم حدثنا أبو رجاء عن حمزة بن جندب قال : كان النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم إذا صلى صلاة أقبل علينا بوجهه فقال ( من رأى منكم الليلة رؤيا ) . قال فإن رأى أحد قصبها فيقول ( ما شاء الله ) . فسألتا يوما فقال ( هل رأى أحد منكم رؤيا ) . قلنا لا قال ( لكبي رأيت الليلة رجلين يأخذان بيدي فأخرجاني إلى الأرض المقدسة فإذا رذل جالس ورجل قائم بيده كlob من حديد ) قال بعض أصحابنا عن موسى ( إنه يدخل ذلك الكوب في شدة حتى يبلغ قفاه ثم يفعل بشدة الآخر مثل ذلك ويلتئم شدة هذا فيعود فيصنع مثله . قلت ما هذا ؟ قال انطلق فانطلقنا حتى أتينا على رجل مططح على قفاه ورجل قائم على رأسه بفهر أو صغيرة فيشدخ بها رأسه فإذا ضربته تهدده الحجر فانطلق إليه ليأخذفه فلا يرجع إلى هذا حتى ينتئم رأسه وعاد رأسه كما هو فماد إليه فضره فقلت من هذا ؟ قال انطلق فانطلقنا إلى ثقب مثل التنور أعلاه ضيق وأسفله واسع يتوقد تحته نارا فإذا اقترب ارتضموا حتى كادوا أن يخرجوا فإذا أخذت رجموا فيها وفيها رجال ونساء عراة فقلت من هذا ؟ قال انطلق فانطلقنا حتى أتينا على نهر من دم فيه رجل قائم وعلى وسط النهر - قال يزيد ووهب ابن جرير عن جرير بن حازم - وعلى شط النهر رجل بين يديه حجارة فأقبل الرجل الذي في النهر فإذا أراد أن يخرج رى الرجل بحجر في فيه فرده حيث كان فجعل كلما جاء ليخرج رى في فيه بحجر فيرجع كلما كان فقلت من هذا ؟ قال انطلق فانطلقنا حتى أتينا إلى روضة خضراء فيها شجرة عظيمة وفي أصلها شيخ وصبيان ورجل قريب من الشجرة بين يديه نار يوقدها فصمدا بي في الشجرة وأدخلاني دارا لم أرفط أحسن منها فيها رجال شيوخ وشباب ونساء وصبيان ثم أخرجاني منها فصمدا في الشجرة فأدخلاني دارا هي أحسن وأفضل فيها شيوخ وشباب قلت طوفتاني الليلة فأخبراني عما رأيت . قال نعم أما الذي رأيته يشق شدة فكذاب يحدث بالكذبة فتحمل عنه حتى تبلغ الآفاق فيصنع به إلى يوم القيامة والذي رأيته يشدخ رأسه فرجل علمه الله القرآن فنام عنه بالليل ولم يعمل فيه بالنهار يفعل به إلى يوم القيامة والذي رأيته في الثقب فهم الزناة والذي رأيته في النهر أكلوا الربا والشيخ في أصل الشجرة إبراهيم عليه السلام والصبيان حوله فأولاد الناس والذي يوقد النار مالك خازن النار والدار الأولى التي دخلت دار عامة المؤمنين وأما هذه الدار فدار الشهداء وأما جبريل وهذا ميكائيل فأرفع رأسك فرفعت رأسي فإذا فوقي مثل الحساب قال ذلك منزلك قلت دعائي أدخل منزلي قال إنه بقي لك عمر لم تستكمل فلو استكملت أتيت منزلك

*Narrated Samura bin Jundab: Whenever the Prophet finished the (morning) prayer, he would face us and ask, "Who amongst you had a dream last night?"*

*So if anyone had seen a dream he would narrate it. The Prophet would say: "Ma sha'a-Allah" (An Arabic maxim meaning literally, 'What Allah wished,' and it indicates a good omen.) One day, he asked us whether anyone of us had seen a dream. We replied in the negative. The Prophet said, "But I had seen (a dream) last night that two men came to me, caught hold of my hands, and took me to the Sacred Land. There, I saw a person sitting and another standing with an iron hook in his hand pushing it inside the mouth of the former till it reached the jaw-bone, and then tore off one side of his cheek, and then did the same with the other side; in the meantime, the first side of his cheek became normal again and then he repeated the same operation. I said, "What is this? They told me to proceed on and we went on till we came to a man lying flat on his back, and another man standing at his head carrying a stone or a piece of rock, and crushing the head of the lying man, with that stone. Whenever he struck him, the stone rolled away. The man went to pick it up and by the time he returned to him, the crushed head had returned to its normal state and the man came back and struck him again (and so on). I said, "Who is this? They told me to proceed on; so we proceeded on and passed by a hole like an oven; with a narrow top and wide bottom, and the fire was kindling underneath that hole. Whenever the fire-flame went up, the people were lifted to such an extent that they were about to get out of it, and whenever the fire got quieter, the people went down into it, and there were naked men and women in it. I said, "Who is this? They told me to proceed. So we proceeded on till we reached a river of blood and a man was in it, and another man was standing at its bank with stones in front of him, facing the*



man standing in the river. Whenever the man in the river wanted to come out, the other one threw a stone in his mouth and caused him to retreat to his original position; and so whenever he wanted to come out the other would throw a stone in his mouth, and he would retreat to his original position. I asked, 'What is this?' They told me to proceed on and we did so till we reached a well-flourished green garden having a huge tree and near its root was sitting an old man with some children. (I saw) Another man near the tree with fire in front of him and he was kindling it up. Then they (i.e. my two companions) made me climb up the tree and made me enter a house, better than which I have ever seen. In it were some old men and young men, women, and children. Then they took me out of this house and made me climb up the tree and made me enter another house that was better and superior (to the first) containing old and young people. I said to them (i.e. my two companions), 'You have made me ramble all the night. Tell me all about what I have seen.' They said, 'Yes. As for the one whose cheek you saw being torn away, he was a liar and he used to tell lies, and the people would report those lies on his authority till they spread all over the world. So, he will be punished like that till the Day of Resurrection. The one whose head you saw being crushed is the one whom Allah had given the knowledge of the Quran but he used to sleep at night and did not use to act upon it by day, and so this punishment will go on till the Day of Resurrection. And those you saw in the hole (like an oven) were adulterers. And those you saw in the river of blood were those dealing in Riba (usury). And the old man who was sitting at the base of the tree was Abraham and the little children around him were the offspring of the people. And the one who was kin-

dling the fire was Malik, the gate-keeper of the Hell-fire. And the first house in which you have gone was the house of the common believers, and the second house was of the martyrs. I am Gabriel and this is Michael. Raise your head.' I raised my head and saw a thing like a cloud over me. They said, 'That is your place.' I said, 'Let me enter my place.' They said, 'You still have some life which you have not yet completed, and when you complete (that remaining portion of your life) you will then enter your place.'

This hadith explicitly indicate that there is torment both collectively (like for adulterers) and individually (like for the Quran scholar and the liar) and the words indicate that it would happen till the day of resurrection. Those who believe that the torment would happen only in a grave claim that it's a dream of the Prophet and need interpretation which is not reported. Unfortunately, they do not see the fallacy of their claim as we are informed that Prophet was palpably describing the dream and the dream was not metaphoric. There were dreams of the Prophet which were metaphoric and the dream was different from prophetic interpretation and reality. There were dreams of the Prophet which were clear and vivid and there are many examples of this kind of dreams in ahadith. For example, Prophet saw in his dream that in Lailatul-Qadr, he would be prostrating in muddy waters and that happened exactly as it is. Similarly, Prophet saw a dream in which he saw himself walking around the Kabbah. Prophet took it as a direct revelation and set out for Umrah but pagans prevented him to enter Makkah, later Allah revealed that (in surah al-Fatah):

لَقَدْ صَدَقَ اللَّهُ رَسُولَهُ الرُّؤْيَا بِالْحَقِّ لَتَدْخُلَنَّ

المَسْجِدِ الْحَرَامِ إِنْ شَاءَ اللَّهُ أَمِينٍ مُخَلِّقِينَ رُءُوسَكُمْ  
وَمُقَصِّرِينَ لَا تَخَافُونَ فَعَلِمَ مَا لَمْ تَعْلَمُوا فَجَعَلَ مِنْ  
دُونِ ذَلِكَ فَتْحًا قَرِيبًا (٢٧)

Indeed Allah shall fulfill the true vision which He showed to His Messenger [i.e. the Prophet saw a dream that he has entered Makkah along with his companions, having their (head) hair shaved and cut short] in very truth.

Certainly, you shall enter Al-Masjid-al-Haram, if Allah wills, secure, (some) having your heads shaved, and (some) having your head hair cut short, having no fear. He knew what you knew not, and He granted besides that a near victory.

The present narration also reports the same kind of dream and that is why no interpretation is asked by the companions of the Prophet. What is indicated in this hadith is that new bodies are given to souls for the affliction of torment. Ibn Hajar said in explanation of this narration (Fath ul Bari juz 20, pg 52):

وَفِيهِ أَنَّ بَعْضَ الْمَصْأَةِ يُعَذَّبُونَ فِي الْبُرْزَخِ .

And the narration has showed that some sinners will be punished in the Burzakh

**Evidence 2: Intestines of the soul?** Imam Bukhari reported in Sahih juz 1, pg 406:

حدثنا محمد بن مقاتل أخبرنا عبد الله أخبرنا يونس عن الزهري عن عروة قال : قالت عائشة خصفت الشمس فقام النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم فقرأ سورة طويلة ثم ركب فأطال ثم رفع رأسه ثم استفتح بسورة أخرى ثم ركب حين قضاها وسجد ثم فعل ذلك في الثانية ثم قال (إنهما آيتان من آيات الله فإذا رأيتم ذلكم فطوبوا حتى يفرج عنكم لقد رأيته في مقامى هذا كل شيء، وعده حتى لقد رأيته أريد أن أخذ قطعا من الجنة حين رأيتموني جمعت أقدم ولقد رأيته جهنم يحطم بعضها بعضا حين رأيتموني تأخرت ورأيته فيها عمرو بن لحي وهو الذي سب السوابب )

*Narrated 'Aisha: Once the sun eclipsed and Allah's Apostle stood up for the prayer and recited a very long Sura and*

when bowed for a long while and then raised his head and started reciting another Sura. Then he bowed, and after finishing, he prostrated and did the same in the second Raka and then said, "These (lunar and solar eclipses) are two of the signs of Allah and if you see them, pray till the eclipse is over. No doubt, while standing at this place I saw everything promised to me by Allah and I saw (Paradise) and I wanted to pluck a bunch (of grapes) there from, at the time when you saw me stepping forward. No doubt, I saw Hell with its different parts destroying each other when you saw me retreating and in it, I saw 'Amr bin Luhai who started the tradition of freeing animals (set them free) in the name of idols.'

Also reported by Sahih al-Bukhari in juz 4, pg 1691:

حدثني محمد بن أبي يعقوب أبو عبد الله الكرماني حدثنا حسان ابن إبراهيم حدثنا يونس عن الزهري عن عروة أن عائشة رضي الله عنها قالت : قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم ( رأيته جهنم يحطم بعضها بعضا ورأيته عمرا يحرق قصبه وهو أول من سب السوابب )

*Narrated Aisha: Allah's Apostle said, "I saw Hell and its different portions were consuming each other and saw 'Amr dragging his intestines (in it), and he was the first person to establish the tradition of letting animals loose (for the idols)."*

In this report clearly, a sign of a new body is present. Amr bin Luhai is dragging his intestines into Hell. The soul does not have intestines. It's a sign of a body.

**Evidence 3: Bird's flight or soul's flight?** It is reported in Sahih Muslim chapter 3, juz 3, pg 1502:

حدثنا يحيى بن يحيى وأبو بكر بن أبي شيبة كلاهما عن أبي معاوية وحديثنا إسماعيل بن إبراهيم أخبرنا جرير وعيسى بن يونس جميعا عن الأعمش ح وحدثنا محمد بن عبدالله بن نمير )

واللفظ له ( حدثنا أسباط وأبو معاوية قالا حدثنا الأعمش عن عبدالله بن مرة عن مسروق قال سألتنا عبدالله ( هو ابن مسعود ) ولا تحمسن الذين قتلوا في سبيل الله أمواتا بل أحياء عند ربهم عن هذه الآية يرزقون [ ٣ / آل عمران / ١٦٩ ] قال أما إننا سألتنا عن ذلك فقال ( أرواحهم في جوف طير خضر لها قناديل معلقة بالعرش تروح من الجنة حيث شاءت ثم تأتي إلى تلك القناديل فاطلع إليهم ربهم إطلاعاً فقال هل تشتهون شيئاً ؟ قالوا أي شيء نشتهي ؟ ونحن نروح من الجنة حيث شئنا ففعل ذلك بهم ثلاث مرات فلما رأوا أنهم لن يتروكوا من أن يسألوا قالوا يا رب نريد أن ترد أرواحنا في أجسادنا حتى نقلت في سبيلك مرة أخرى فلما رأى أن ليس لهم حاجة تروكوا )

*Masrooq said: We asked Abdullah (ibn Masood) about the verse Think not of those who are killed in the Way of Allah as dead. Nay, they are alive, with their Lord, and they have provision. He said Indeed we asked Prophet about this he said: Souls are in Green bird, they have chandeliers hanging to the Holy Throne of paradise. They go where they want and then return to the chandeliers, Their Lord informed them and said: Do ye desire anything? They replied (O Lord) anything we need! we go out in paradise where we want. Their Lord asked them the same three times. When they saw that Lord would not leave asking them, they said, Lord, we want that our souls to be returned to our bodies until we kill for the Way again. When he saw that they need nothing. He stopped asking them.*

It is reported in Sahih al-Bukhari juz 3, pg 1360:

حدثني عمرو بن علي حدثنا يزيد بن هارون أخبرنا إسماعيل ابن أبي خالد عن الشعبي : أن ابن عمر رضي الله عنهما كان إذا سلم على ابن جعفر قال السلام عليك يا ابن ذي الجناحين

*Narrated Ash-Sha'bi: Whenever Ibn 'Umar greeted Ibn Jafar, he used to say: "As-salamu-'Alaika (i.e. Peace be on you) O son of Dhu-l-Janahain (son of the two-winged person)." The martyrs got new bodies that can fly. Scholars who do not*

believe in the new bodies say that green birds for the martyrs are like airplanes. Their souls sit into these flying creatures. However, the word ابن ذي الجناحين contradicts these assumptions. The wings are given to companion Jafar and that is why he is called the two-winged. The war of Mauta occurred in 8 AH, in which Jafar was martyred.

**Evidence 4: Milk-sucking soul?** It is reported in Sahih al-Bukhari juz 1 pg 465:

حدثنا أبو الوليد حدثنا شعبة عن عدي بن ثابت : أنه سمع البراء رضي الله عنه قال لما توفي إبراهيم عليه السلام قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم ( إن له مرضعا في الجنة )

*Narrated Al-Bara: When Ibrahim (the son of the Prophet) died, Allah's Apostle said, "There is a wet nurse for him in Paradise."*

Further Prophet informed that his son Ibrahim goes to heaven where he has a body that could enjoy milk! Does the soul need milk?

**Evidence 5: Azab al-Qabr even before burial?** It is reported in Sahih al-Bukhari Volume 2, Book 23, Number 376:

حدثنا عبد الله بن يوسف أخبرنا مالك عن عبد الله بن أبي بكر عن أبيه عن عمرة بنت عبد الرحمن أنها أخبرته : أنها سمعت عائشة رضي الله عنها زوج النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم قالت إنما مر رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم على يهودية يبكي عليها أهلها فقال ( إنهم يبكون عليها وإنها لتعذب في قبرها )

*Narrated 'Aisha: (the wife of the Prophet) Once Allah's Apostle passed by a Jewess whose relatives were weeping over her. He said, "They are weeping over her and she is being tortured in her grave."*

In Sahih Muslim juz 2, pg 643, chapter it is reported: باب الميت يعذب ببكاء أهله عليه



وحدثنا قتيبة بن سعيد عن مالك بن أنس فيما فرئ عليه  
عن عبدالله بن أبي بكر عن أبيه عن عمرة بنت  
عبدالرحمن أنها أخبرته أنها سمعت عائشة وذكر لها أن  
عبدالله بن عمر يقول : إن الميت ليعذب ببكاء الحي  
فقال عائشة يغفر الله لأبي عبدالرحمن أما أنه لم  
يكذب ولكنه نسى أو أخطأ إنما مر رسول الله صلى الله  
عليه وسلم على يهودية يبكي عليها فقال إنهم ليبكون  
عليها وإنها لتعذب في قبرها

*Narrated 'Aisha (the wife of the Prophet) when if is reported to her that Abdul-lah ibn Umer said Indeed dead would be tormented for the weeping of the living (relatives), so she said May Allah forgive Abi Abdur-Rehman (Abdullah ibn Umer) he is not a liar but did mistake or forgot Allah's Apostle once passed by a Jewess whose relatives were weeping over her. He said, "They are weeping over her and she is being tortured in her grave."*

Both of these narrations indicate that the Jewess was not even buried but she was tormented due to the weeping of her relatives. This indicates that the word Qabr in Prophet's era refers to the abode in Burzakh.

The faction of scholars who believe in the returning of the soul to the dead claim that the narrators of this narration mistakenly dropped the word grave. Prophet had passed by the grave of a Jewess. To support their argument they present the narrations from Musnad Ahmed juz 2, pg 38, Sunnan Nisai juz 1, pg 262, Sunan Abi Dawood juz 3, pg 163, etc. However, they forget that they claim that any thing narrated by the narrators of Sahiheen is authentic. Are they not digressing from their previous claim?

This narration is heard by eight people with the Sanad (chain) of Hassham bin Urwa from Urwa from 'Aisha with some variation of words. The most trustworthy among these eight narrators is

Hammad bin Zaid, a very famous Imam of Jarah and Tadeel. He reported that the Prophet passed by the Jannaza (funeral bier) of a Jew!

Muslim juz 2 pg 642 chapter reported: باب الميت يعذب ببكاء أهله عليه

وحدثنا خلف بن هشام وأبو الربيع الزهراني جميعا عن حماد قال خلف حدثنا حماد بن زيد عن هشام بن عروة عن أبيه قال : ذكر عند عائشة قول ابن عمر الميت يعذب ببكاء أهله عليه فقالت رحم الله أبا عبدالرحمن سمع شيئا فلم يحفظه إنما مرت على رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم جنازة يهودي وهم يبكون عليه فقال أنتم تبكون وإنه ليعذب

*When Aisha was informed about the statement of Ibn Umer that the dead are tortured due to the crying of relatives, she said O Allah, Send your mercy on Abu Abdul Rahman, he heard something which now he remembered not. Messenger of Allah PBUH passed by the funeral bier of a Jew and they were crying so he said you weep for him and he is being tortured.*

This other narration of Sahih Muslim shows that the Jew was not even buried. The issue is not whether the dead person was male or female, the issue is whether he or she was buried or still on the surface.

This evidence made it quite clear that the Azab al-Qabr is executed in Burzakh and it has nothing to do with the grave on earth.

**Narration on the Returning  
of a soul to the dead body**

The narration which is presented to support the widely held belief that the torment occurs in the earthly grave is attributed to Byra bin Azib, a companion of the Prophet peace be upon him. This narration is reported in Musnad Ahmed, juz4, pg, 287; Abi Dawood juz 13, pg 494; Ibn Abi Shibah juz 3, pg 310, Hakim juz 1, pg 37, etc with some variations in text:

حدثنا عبد الله حدثني أبي ثنا أبو معاوية قال ثنا الأعمش عن منهل بن عمرو عن زاذان عن البراء بن عازب قال : خرجنا مع النبي صلى الله عليه و سلم في جنازة رجل من الأنصار فاتهمنا إلى القبر ولما يلحد فجلس رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم وجلسنا حوله وكان على رءوسنا الطير وفي يده عود ينكت في الأرض فرفع رأسه فقال استعذبوا بالله من عذاب القبر مرتين أو ثلاثا ثم قال ان العبد المؤمن إذا كان في انقطاع من الدنيا وإقبال من الآخرة نزل إليه ملائكة من السماء بيض الوجوه كأن وجوههم الشمس معهم كفن من أكفان الجنة وحنوط من حنوط الجنة حتى يجلسوا منه مد البصر ثم يجيء ملك الموت عليه السلام حتى يجلس عند رأسه فيقول أيتها النفس الطيبة أخرجي إلى مغفرة من الله ورضوان قال فتخرج تسيل كما تسيل القطرة من في السماء فيأخذها فإذا أخذها لم يدعوها في يده طرفة عين حتى يأخذها فيجعلوها في ذلك الكفن وفي ذلك الحنوط ويخرج منها كأطيب نفحة مسك وجدت على وجه الأرض قال فيصعدون بها فلا يرون معنى بها على ملائكة الا قالوا ما هذا الروح الطيب فيقولون فلان بن فلان بأحسن أسمائه التي كانوا يسمونه بها في الدنيا حتى يتبوا بها إلى السماء الدنيا فيستفتحون له فيفتح لهم فيشبهه من كل سماء مقربوها إلى السماء التي تليها حتى يتبى به إلى السماء السابعة فيقول الله عز و جل اكتبوا كتاب عبدي في عليين وأعيدوه إلى الأرض فإني منها خلقتهم وفيها أعيدهم ومنها أخرجهم تارة أخرى قال فتعاد روحه في جسده فيأتيه ملكان فيجلسانه فيقولان له من ربك فيقول ربي الله فيقولان له ما دينك فيقول ديني الإسلام فيقولان له ما هذا الرجل الذي بعث فيكم فيقول هو رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم فيقولان له وما علمك فيقول قرأت كتاب الله فأمنت به وصدقت فينادي مناد في السماء ان صدق عبدي فأفرشوه من الجنة وألبسوه من الجنة وافتحوا له بابا إلى الجنة قال فيأتيه من روحها وطيبها ويفسح له في قبره مد بصره قال ويأتيه رجل حسن الوجه حسن الثياب طيب الريح فيقول أبشر بالذي يسرك هذا يومك الذي كنت توعده فيقول له من أنت فوجهك الوجه يجيء بالخير فيقول أنا عمك الصالح فيقول رب أقم الساعة حتى

أرجع إلى أهلي وما لي قال وان العبد الكافر إذا كان في انقطاع من الدنيا وإقبال من الآخرة نزل إليه من السماء ملائكة سود الوجوه معهم المسوح فيجلسون منه مد البصر ثم يجيء ملك الموت حتى يجلس عند رأسه فيقول أيتها النفس الخبيثة أخرجي إلى سخط من الله وغضب قال فتفرق في جسده فيترعها كما يترع السفود من الصوف المبلول فيأخذها فإذا أخذها لم يدعوها في يده طرفة عين حتى يجعلوها في تلك المسوح ويخرج منها كأنتن ريح جيفة وجدت على وجه الأرض فيصعدون بها فلا يرون بها على ملائكة الا قالوا ما هذا الروح الخبيث فيقولون فلان بن فلان بأفح أسمائه التي كان يسمى بها في الدنيا حتى يتبى به إلى السماء الدنيا فيستفتح له فلا يفتح له ثم قرأ رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم سم الحياط فيقول الله عز و جل اكتبوا ومن يشرك بالله فكأنما خر من السماء فتخطفه الطير أو تهوي به كتابه في سمعين في الأرض السفلى فتطرح روحه طرحا ثم قرأ الريح في مكان سحيق فتعاد روحه في جسده ويأتيه ملكان فيجلسانه فيقولان له من ربك فيقول هاه هاه لا أدري فيقولان له ما دينك فيقول هاه هاه لا أدري فيقولان له ما هذا الرجل الذي بعث فيكم فيقول هاه هاه لا أدري فينادي مناد من السماء ان كذب فأفرشوا له من النار وافتحوا له بابا إلى النار فيأتيه من حرها وسمومها ويضيق عليه قبره حتى تختلف فيه أضلعه ويأتيه رجل قبيح الوجه قبيح الثياب منتن الريح فيقول أبشر بالذي يسوءك هذا يومك الذي كنت توعده فيقول من أنت فوجهك الوجه يجيء بالشر فيقول أنا عمك الخبيث فيقول رب لا تم الساعة

In some narrations there is an addition that

فيقضي له أصم أبكم معه مرزبة ولو ضرب بها فيل صار ترابا أو قال ريميا فيضربه ضربة تسمعها الخلائق إلا الثقلين ثم تعاد فيه الروح فيضربه ضربة أخرى

Byra bin Azib reported that we went out with the Prophet, peace be upon him at the funeral of a man from Ansar so we arrived at the grave and it was not ready; Messenger of Allah peace be upon him sat and we sat around him as if birds are over our heads and in his hands was a twig through which he was engraving on the ground. He raised his head and said: Ask forgiveness of Allah from the torment of the grave two or three times and then said that for the righteous person at the interruption of this

world and the beginning of the Hereafter, came down the angels from heaven with bright faces as if their faces are the sun. With them is a shroud of Paradise and shrouds of the musk of paradise, they sit until the range of sight. Then arrives the Angel of Death, peace be upon him until sits at his (righteous person's) head and says, O good soul come out towards the forgiveness of God and His happiness. He said: It comes out flowing like flowing drop from the waterskin, he (angel) takes the souls and it does not remain with him for an eye blink and the souls are taken from him by (other) angels. Then they adorn the soul with the heavenly attire and engulfed it in heavenly scent. A scent then erupts from the souls which smelled better than the Musk fragrances of the earth. Prophet said: The angels (carrying soul) ascend towards heaven. As they passes by the schools of angels (already in heaven), Angels inquired: Which pious soul is this? They are told that he is the son of that. They utter his (dead person) most worthy name through which he is called on earth. Angels take him to heaven and request that the doors of heaven be opened for it and doors are opened. Afterward, the angels of the presence of each sky would accompany this soul until they reach the seventh sky. Allah says: Inscribe the book of my slave in Illiyen and return him to the earth as by it, I have created them and to which I would return them and brought them out at another time. (Prophet) Said: so the soul is returned in the body, and comes two angels to him which sat him. They also ask him: Who is your Lord? He says my Lord is Allah. They ask him: What is your faith? He says: Islam is my faith. They ask: Who was the person sent among you? He says: He (Muhammad PBUH) is the prophet. They inquire: How do

you come to know all about it? He says: I read the book of Allah, believed in it, and attested it. A voice then comes from the sky: My slave spoke truth so laid the floor of Heavens for him, adorned him in heavenly attire, and open the door of heaven for him. Said: The fragrance of heavens started reaching him and his grave is extended till the eyesight. (Prophet) Said: After that comes a handsome person, perfumed and beautifully dressed. He comes to the righteous person, with these bounties remain blissful, these are the tidings for you, this is the day promised to you. A righteous person inquires Who are you? Your face is like blessings achieved. He says: I am your good deed. Then the righteous person prayed that O Lord establishes the day of Judgement, so that I may return to my family. Prophet said: When the infidel leaves this world and about to enter in hereafter, come the angels from heavens with black faces with a jute rug. They sat with the distance till reaches eye slight. After that comes the angel of Death who sit close to his head and says O evil soul come out towards the wrath of God and His anger. Said: The soul then spreads inside the body, Angel of death then dragged it out like an iron spike is taken out from the wool. As soon as the angel of death took hold of the soul, come other angels and with in an eye blink took it from his hands and fold it into a jute rug. From it (souls) erupts the most vicious of smells. Angels take it and ascend upwards, as they pass by schools of angels, they inquire: Which evil soul is this? Angels call the worst name of it, through which he was famous the earth. Until they reach the first sky and asked for the door to be opened but it is not allowed. Prophet then recited this verse: The doors of the sky would not be opened for them until the camel

goes through the passage of the needle. Then Allah orders: Inscribe his name in Sijjeen, which is the under-world.

Then the soul is thrown down and Prophet recited verse whoever assigns partners to Allah, it is as if he had fallen from the sky, and the birds had snatched him, or the wind had thrown him to a far off place. . . Then his soul is returned to the body and arrives two angels which sat him and ask: Who is your Lord? He says alas I know it not. They ask: What is your faith? He says: Alas I know it not. They ask: Who was the person sent among you? He says: Alas I do not know. Then resound a voice from heaven He lied so laid the blanket of fire – open a door of Hell. So come to him the heat of hell fire and its stench. The grave is so squeezed that his ribs are en-

graved into one another. Then comes a man with a hideous face and squalidly dressed with a stench erupting from him. He comes and said I want to give you the tidings of things which would make you sad. This the day- promised to you! Infidel inquired: Who are you, with such a hideous face full of evilness? He says: I am your evil deeds. On that, he cried: O Lord Let not the Time (day of judgment) come!

(additional part in some books)

Then appointed on him a deaf or mute with mace, that if he would strike the Elephant it would become mud or said dust, the strikes a blow which is heard by all the creatures except Humans and Jinns and then returned the soul (again to body) it strikes another blow.

#### Endorsement of Narration of Zazzan

Al-Hakim Al-Nishabori committed a mistake in endorsing this narration in his compilation Mustadrak Al-Hakim. Mustadrak Al-Hakim is replete with such mistakes and scholars over the ages have indicated these mistakes. Al-Hakim was a prolific author and has written many books. Mustadrak is a book which according to Al-Hakim contains narrations that both Imam Bukhari and Imam Muslims have not included in their Sahih or Jamah. Al-Hakim assuming that he understood the rules of selection of Sahih narrations by Bukhari and Muslims, complied with the Mustadrak. In several places, he has written “on the conditions of both (Bukhari Muslim) but they have not reported it” i.e. the said narration is fulfilling the conditions of Bukhari and Muslims but they have not included those in

Sahiheen.

Such endorsements of Hakim are criticized by major scholars over the years see Nasb-ur-Raya by Zalai, Tazkira tul-Huffaz by Dahabi, Meezan Al-Ateedal by Dahabi, Lisan al-Meezan by Ibn-Hajar, etc.

Al-Hakim said for the narration of Byra bin azib from Zazzan that (Mustadrak , juz 1, pg 51):

هذا حديث صحيح على شرط الشيخين فقد احتجا جميعا بالنهال  
بن عمرو و زاذان أبي عمر الكندي و في هذا الحديث فوائد كثيرة  
لأهل السنة و وقع للمتدعة و لم يخرجاه بطوله

*This narration is sahih on the conditions of both Sheiks (i.e. Bukhari Muslim) as both have taken narrations from Minhal bin Amr and Zazzan Abi Umer Al-Kindi and it has many benefits for Ahl-Sunnah and suppression for heretics but has not included it due to its length.*

Dahabi has written in his noting over Mustadrak (see juz 1, pg 51):

تعليق الذهبي في التلخيص : على شرطهما فقد احتجا بالنهال  
*Noting of Dahabi in Talkhees: As per their standards and they both (Bukhari Muslim) have taken narrations from Minhal*

This is a mistake from Dahabi, as Imam Muslim has not taken any narration from Minhal bin Amr. So the statement of Dahabi is incorrect.

Dahabi has written Seer-Allam Al-Nabla and Tarikh Islam after the compilation of his notes on Mustadrak. As he indicated elsewhere.

Dahabi writes in Tarikh al-Islam Juz 1, 2942:

. وفي بعض ذلك موضوعات قد أعلمت بها لما اختصرت هذا آ  
المستدرك آ ونهت على ذلك  
*And for these issues, I have informed in my synopsis of this Mustadark and alerted (the reader)*

In Seer Allam, Juz 17, pg 175 he writes:

وبكل حال فهو كتاب مفيد قد اختصرته،  
*And in all respect, that book (Mustadrak) is a useful book I have shortened it and . . .*

Thus it is clear from these excerpts that Talkhis over Mustadrak was compiled before the thorough work of Seer Allam and Tahrikh al-Islam

Therefore the endorsement of Dahabi for the Minhal narration as quoted above could not be taken seriously. In this later work, he refuted this narration, as mentioned earlier from the references of Seer-Allam and Tahrikh Islam.

Dahabi said in Seer Aallam ( juz 5, pg 184 ) compiled after his noting on Mustadrak:

قلت: حديثه في شأن القبر بطوله فيه نكارة وغبابة، يروي عن زاذان عن البراء

*I say: his lengthy narration regarding the grave has Nikkarat (against established hadith) and Gharabat (uniqueness), which he narrates from Zazzan from Byra*

Dahabi refuted this narration in his later work and in a way cleared his position.

Al- Baihaqui had compiled a book on the narrations of Azab-al-Qabr. As such the book is compiled against the Mu'tazilah. Mu'tazilah was the speculative theology that flourished in Basra and Baghdad. Mu'tazilah theological school is traced back to Wāṣil ibn Aṭā (699–749) who was a student of al-asan al-Baṣri. Mu'tazilah were the stalwart opposer of the idea that there would be any torment in the grave. It was the kind of aberrant school that indulged in philosophical details of Islamic thought and believe. They were the fore-runners of the so-called created-Quran (Khalq-al-Quran) dogma in the era of Abbāsīd caliph al-Mamūn.

Baihaqui has compiled a book titled in which he has included 240 narrations about the torment in grave. Baihaqui has not given any of his opinions on the narration weaknesses as he did for his book on issue of recitation of Fatiah behind the Imam. Baihaqui said in this book:

قال عمرو في حديثه عن منهال عن زاذان عن البراء عن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم فيقيض له أصم أبكم معه مرزبة ولو ضرب بها فيل صار ترابا أو قال ربما فيضربه ضربة تسمعها الخلائق إلا الثقلين ثم تعاد فيه الروح فيضربه ضربة أخرى هذا حديث كبير صحيح الإسناد رواه جماعة من الأئمة الثقات عن الأعمش وأخرجه أبو

داود سليمان بن الأشعث السجستاني في كتاب السنن

*Amr said in narration: from Minhal from Zazzan from Byra from Prophet then appointed on him a deaf or mute with mace, that if he would strike the Elephant it would become mud or said dust, the strikes a blow which is heard by all the creatures except Humans Jinns and then returned the soul (again*

*to body) it strikes another blow. This is a well-known hadith with a sahih chain of narrators and narrated by a group of authentic scholars from Al-Amash and it is reported by Abu Dawood Sulemain bin Al-Ashas Al-Sijistani in his Kitab on Sunnan.*

Baihaqui thus supported this narration.

### Narration of Zazzan is against Quran

(attributed to Byra bin Azib)

It would be necessary to analyze what is stated in the narration instead of accepting it at face value.

#### Confusion over Illiyen and Sijjen:

It is stated in the narration that God commanded:

*Inscribe the book of my slave in Illiyen and return him to the earth ...Inscribe his name in Sijjen, which is the underworld.*

Sijjin as an under-world has no basis in Quran and Sahih Ahadith. God Almighty informed us in his glorious book that Sijjin is a register, not a place.

كَلَّا إِنَّ كِتَابَ الْفُجَّارِ لَفِي سِجِّينَ (٧) وَمَا أُذْرَاكَ مَا سِجِّينَ (٨) كِتَابٌ مَرْقُومٌ (٩)

*Nay! Truly, the Record (writing of the deeds) of the Fujjar (disbelievers, sinners, evil-doers, and wicked) is (preserved) in Sijjin. And what will make you know what Sijjin is? A Register inscribed.*

Likewise Illiyen is the record of righteous people.

كَلَّا إِنَّ كِتَابَ الْأَبْرَارِ لَفِي عِلِّيَّينَ (١٨) وَمَا أُذْرَاكَ

مَا عَلَيَّونَ (١٩) كِتَابٌ مَرْقُومٌ (٢٠) يَشْهَدُهُ الْمُرَقَّبُونَ (٢١)

*Nay! Verily, the Record (writing of the deeds) of Al-Abrar (the pious who fear Allah and avoid evil), is (preserved) in 'Illiyyun. And what will make you know what 'Illiyyun is? A Register inscribed. To which bear witness those nearest (to Allah, i.e. the angels).*

Unfortunately, the group of scholars who claim that Zazzan's narration from Byra bin Azib's narration is authentic also sometimes claim that it is the name of the place!

#### Doors of the sky would not be opened for Infidels?

It is claimed in the narration that when the angels ascend with the soul of the evil-doer then:

*Until they reach the first sky and asked for the door to be opened but it is not allowed. Prophet then recited this verse: The doors of the sky would not be opened for them until the camel goes through the passage of the needle. If this is the rule that the door of the sky would not be opened for a soul then why do the same group of scholars (which believe in the returning of the soul to the dead body) claim that the soul after questioning in the grave goes back to Hell? Does*

it mean that the camel has crossed the passage of the needle? There is a contradiction between their beliefs and what the narrators are portraying. Narrators (Minhal bin Amr and Zazzan) would like to stress that souls after death remain on earth irrespective of whether the person is righteous or infidel.

#### Complications due to Additional text

What these narrators are purporting is that the soul's return to the body does not happen only once times, rather it is an ongoing process. As reported in the Idafa:

.. Then appointed on him a deaf or mute with mace, that if he would strike the Elephant it would become mud or said dust, the strikes a blow which is heard by all the creatures except Humans Jinns and then returned the soul (again to body) it strikes another blow.

Since this (Idafa) addition is against

the widespread belief that the soul would be returned to the body in the grave only once. It was necessary to refute it somehow. Therefore the newly emerged so-called Salafi followers claim that this addition (Idafa) is not authentic. However, their predecessors like Ibn-Tammiah quoted this addition twice in his Fatawah. Ibn-Qayyam quoted this addition in Kitab-ur-Ruh and the recent era scholar Nasiruddin Al-Bani declared this Idafa authentic.

Recently a group called Ahl-Hadith in Pakistan has refuted this Idafa claiming that it is not valid (see Al-Musnad fi Azab al-Qabr by Muhammad Arshad Kamal pg 152). However, Mr. Arshad Kamal has blatantly used the endorsement of Baihaqui, Ibn-Qayyam, Al-Bani, etc. (see Al-Musnad fi Azab al-Qabr by Muhammad Arshad Kamal pg 150-151) and hid the fact that these scholars consider this addition also authentic.

#### Trustworthiness of Narrator

Zazzan:

Imam Al-Dolabi informed us in his work titled Al-Kuna-wal-Asma (juz 4- pg 404) that the Zazzan was among the Shiites.

أخبرني محمد بن إبراهيم بن هانم ، عن أبيه ، عن محمد بن عمر قال : زاذان أبو عمر الفارسي مولى لكتندة ، أدرك عمر ، وكان من أصحاب عبد الله ، وكان من شيعة علي ، هلك في سلطان عبد الملك

*Muhammad bin Umer (Al-Waqidi) said that Zazzan Abu Umer Al-Farisi Maula Kindah found (the era of) Umer and was among the people of Abdullah (ibn Masood) and was from Shiites of Ali, died in the regime of Sultan Abdul-Malik.*

The statement of Al-Waqidi is a historical record. Further, Ibn- Hajar said

in Taqreeb al-Tahzeeb (juz 1, pg 307):

زاذان أبو عمر الكندي البزاز ويكنى أبا عبد الله أيضا صدوق يرسل وفيه شيعية من الثانية مات سنة اثننتين وثمانين

*Zazzan Abu Umer al-Kindi Al-Bazzaz and nicknamed Aba Abdullah also Sudoq times commit Irsal and has Shiite inclination died in year eighty-two.*

Ibn-Hajar and Dolabi both informed about the Shiite connection of Zazzan. The group of scholar which support the belief in returning the soul to the dead claim that Ibn-Hajar was influenced by Al- Waqidi. However, there are pieces of evidence that support the inclination of Zazzan toward Shia'ism. Further,



it would be interesting to know that Ibn-Hajar has quoted Muhammad bin Umer Al-Waqidi more than 200 times in Tahzeeb al-Tahzeeb only. This reflects the acceptance of Waqidi in keeping the record of history.

There are many narrations reported by Zazzan which reflect his Shiite tendencies. Not only that he is considered as an authentic narrator in Shiite literature like Usool-al-Kafi etc.

Dr. Bashshar Awwad Al-Marooof has indicated that narrations from Zazzan are quoted in Shiite literature like and also in another book titled *التبذير: باب من الزيادات في القضايا والاحكام*, حديث رقم ١٢. Muslim has quoted narration from Zazzan in three places. Bukhari has not taken any narration from Zazzan.

**Heresy of Narrator al-Minhal**  
The narrator of this so-called hadith, Minhal bin Amr is also considered as one having heretic beliefs. Imam Jozjani reported in his work Ahwal-ur-Rejal

قال إبراهيم بن يعقوب الجوزجاني المنهال بن عمرو بن سيء المذهب وقد جرى حديثه  
*Jozjani said: Minhal bin Amr - bad faith (heretic) but his narrations are in circulation!*

Abdurrehman bin Yahyah al-Muallami al-Yamani writes in his work titled , juz 1 pg 150 that:

وقد تتبعت كثيراً من كلام الجوزجاني في المتشيعين فلم أجده متجاوزاً الحد ، وإنما الرجل لما فيه من النصب يرى التشيع مذهباً سيئاً وبدعة ضلالة وزيفاً عن الحق وخذلانا ، فيطلق على المتشيعين ما يقضيه اعتقاده كقوله (( زائغ عن القصد - سيء المذهب )) ونحو ذلك ،  
*And many have tracked the statements of Jozjani for the Shiite (narrators) but did not find them exceeding the limit, but the man (i.e. Imam Jozjani) because of the Nasab sees the Shi'ism as followers of bad (heretic) doctrine and going astray and elusive on the right and disappointment, the application of term on Shiites is what is deserved to*

*them due to their faith ((digressing on intent-bad doctrine)), etc.*

Dahabi has quoted in Meezan al-Atedal (juz 4/ pg 192) the following statements

وقال الحاكم : غمزه يحيى بن سعيد.  
*And Hakim said: Yahyah bin Saeed reduced him*

he said further

وكذا تكلم فيه ابن حزم، ولم يحتج بحديثه الطويل في فتنان القبر  
*and Ibn- Hazm said likewise and rejected his long narration on questioning in the grave*

Ibn- Hajar said in Taqreeb Al-Tahzeeb (juz 2, pg 216) :

المنهال بن عمرو الأسدي مولاهم الكوفي صدوق ربما وهم من الخامسة  
*Minhal bin Amr Al-Asadi ... is Sadooq sometimes confused, belongs to the fifth category*

For the fifth category Ibn-Hajar described in Taqreeb Al-Tahzeeb:



الخامسة: من قصر عن الرابعة قليلاً، وإليه الإشارة بصدوق سي، الحفظ، أو صدوق ييم، أو له أوهام، أو يخطئ، أو تغير بأخرة ويلتحق بذلك من رمى بنوع من البدعة، كالتشيع والقدر، والنصب، والإرجاء، والتجهم، مع بيان الداعية من غيره.

*Fifth: these are reduced from fourth and they are indicated by words Sadooque, bad memory or with Sadooque confused, Sadooque has confusions or commits mistakes or had amnesia in late age and*

*afflicted with heresy like Shiite, Qadr, Nasb, Irja, Tahhajum with a description of their heresy, etc.*

Imam Bukhari has reported two narrations from Minhal, one is about a supplication, and at another place the chain is quoted to support the main narration. Muslim has not reported any narration from Minhal bin Amr.

#### Rejection of Zazzan naration by Ibn Habban

قال أبو حاتم رحمة الله عليه خبر الأعمش عن المنهال بن عمرو عن زاذان عن البراء سمعه الأعمش عن الحسن بن عمارة عن المنهال بن عمرو وزاذان لم يسمعه من البراء فذلك لم أخرجه

*Abu Hatim may blessings of Allah be on him said: The report of Al-Amash from Minhal bin Amr from Zazzan from Byra, heard Al-Amash (actually) from Hasan bin Ammara from Minhal bin Amr and (further) Zazzan has not listened (anything) from Byra, that's why I haven't recorded.*

Rejection of this narration by Ibn-Hazm (died 456 AH) in Al-Muhalli, juz 1, pg 22:

ولم يرو أحد أن في عذاب القبر رد الروح إلى الجسد الا المنهال بن عمرو وليس بالقوى  
*None had reported that the soul would be returned to the body for torment in the grave except Minhal bin Amr and he is not a stalwart () narrator.*

Rejection of this narration by Al-Dahabi (died 748 AH): al-Dahabi said in Tahrik Al- Islam juz 1, pg 894:

قلت : تفرد بحديث منكر وتكبير عن زاذان عن البراء

*I say: he has Tafarud (unique in reporting) the hadith on Munkr and Nakeer from Zazzan from Byra.*

Despite these refutations, there is clear opposition from the other faction of scholars like Hakim, Baihaqui, Ibn-Tammiah, and Ibn-Qayyam.

Dahabi declared that the narration of Byra bin Azib contains Nakarat which indicates that it is against the authentic hadith. It is reported in Sahih Muslim, juz 4, pg 2202 that:

( ٢٨٧٢ ) حدثني عبيدالله بن عمر القواريري حدثنا حماد بن زيد حدثنا بديل عن عبدالله بن شقيق عن أبي هريرة : قال إذا خرجت روح المؤمن تلقاها ملكان يصعدانها قال حماد فذكر من طيب ريحها وذكر المسك قال ويقول أهل السماء روح طيبة جاءت من قبل الأرض صلى الله عليك وعلى جسد كنت تعميرنه فينطلق به إلى ربه عز وجل ثم يقول انطلقوا به إلى آخر الأجل قال وإن الكافر إذا خرجت روحه - قال حماد وذكر من نتنها وذكر لعنا - ويقول أهل السماء روح خبيثة جاءت من قبل الأرض قال فيقال انطلقوا به إلى آخر الأجل قال أبو هريرة فرد رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم ربطة كانت عليه على أنفه هكذا  
*Abu Hurrirah said: As the soul of righteous man comes out then comes two angels in front of him and ascend him upwards. Hammad said then talked*



*about the scent and smell of musk and people of heaven said: A pious soul comes from Earth blessings of Allah be on you and the body which you have grown. Then angels take it to Lord All mighty and then (it is commanded) Take it till the final term. (Abu Huraira) said: and the Infidel when his soul comes out – Hammad said he talked about the stench and curse over it- and said: The people of heaven said: A wicked soul comes from Earth and (it is commanded) Take it till the final term.*

*Abu Hurrirah said then Prophet peace be upon him covered his nose like this (i.e. to indicate the wicked soul's stench)*

This narration of Sahih Muslim denounces what is stated in Byra bin Azib's narration. The soul of the Infidel also goes to heaven neither it is returned to the body in the grave nor there is the wrong application that the soul of the infidel would not go to heaven until the camel crosses the needle passage!

Traces of Jewish thought  
in Zazzan's narration

The actual process of dying is stated in Midrash as follows. The purpose of Midrash was to resolve problems in the interpretation of difficult passages in the text of the Hebrew Bible. The time of the start of its writing is estimated to occur 505 CE by Jewish scholars, which is equivalent to 122 BH i.e. 122 years before the Hijri calendar had started. Following are the two excerpts taken from a book written by the Jewish scholar Abraham Cohen:

The actual process of dying is described in this manner: *'When a person's end comes to depart from the world, the angel of death appears to take away his soul (Neshamah). The Neshamah is like a vein full of blood, and it has small veins which are dispersed throughout the body. The angel of death grasps the top of this vein and extracts it. From the body of a righteous person he extracts it gently, a thought drawing a hair out of milk; but from the body of a wicked person it is like whirling waters at the entrance of a canal or, as others say, like taking thorns out of a ball of wool which tear backward. As soon as this is extracted the person*

*dies and the spirit issues forth and settles on his nose until the body decays. When this happens it cries and weeps before the holy one blessed be he, saying lord of the universe! Whether I am being led? Immediately (the angel) Dumah takes and conducts him to the court of death among the spirits. If he had been righteous it is proclaimed before him, Clear a place for such a righteous man and he proceeds stage by stage until he beholds the presence of Shechinah'* (Midrash to Ps. Xi.7; 51b,52 a) [from Everyman's Talmud by Abraham Cohen Page 74, Schocken Books, 1995 ]

Also : The opinion generally adopted was that the soul rejoined to the body for judgment and it is expressed in this statement: *'Throughout 12 months (after death in Gehinnom) the body exists and soul ascends and descends, after 12 months the body ceases to exist and soul ascends without descending'* (Shab. 152b et seq.). [from Everyman's Talmud Pg 376]

Now Zazzan's description of the dying process is: When the infidel leaves this world and is about to enter in hereafter, come the angels from the heavens with black faces with jute rugs. They

sat with the distance till reaches eye slight. After that comes the angel of Death who sit close to his head and says O evil soul come out towards the wrath of God and His anger. Said: The soul then spreads inside the body, Angel of death then dragged it out like an iron spike is taken out from the wool. As soon as the angel of death took hold of the soul, come other angels and within an eye, blink took it from his hands, and fold it into a jute rug. From it (souls)

erupts the most vicious of smells. Angels take it and ascend upwards,...

The reader might be surprised to read this. What a similarity the Midrash passage has with Zazzan's narration! One in Hebrew and one in Arabic. Readers must know that in the Talmudic era, this text is only available to Jewish scholars. It shows that there is a fabric of truth in saying that there are Jewish traces in Shiite thought of Zazzan and his student Minhal.

When did Allah Almighty inform Prophet peace be upon him about Azab al-Qabr?

The verses related to torment of fire for Pharoah and his army and also for Noah's nation are revealed in Makkah. Bukhari (Volume 4, Book 52, Number 182) reported that during war of Al-Ahzab (i.e. the clans) Prophet peace be upon him said :

حدثنا عبد الله بن محمد حدثنا يزيد أخبرنا هشام عن محمد عن عبيدة عن علي رضي الله عنه قال النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم حدثني عبد الرحمن حدثنا يحيى بن سعيد حدثنا هشام قال حدثنا محمد عن عبيدة عن علي رضي الله عنه : أن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم قال يوم الخندق ( حبسونا عن الصلاة الوسطى حتى غابت الشمس ملاً الله قبورهم وبيوتهم أو أجوافهم - شك يحيى - ناراً )

*Narrated 'Ali: Allah's Apostle said on the day of the battle of Trench they prevented us from performing the prayer (i.e. 'Asr) till the sunset. O Allah! Fill their graves and houses or bellies – forgot (narrator) Yahyah - with fire.*

War of Trench took place in Zil-Qaadah 5 A.H. This indicates that the torment of graves for pagans was well

known at that time. Also, note that the pagans who were killed in the War of Trenches were not even buried. Were there graves of pagans in the war zone? This again indicates that the word (graves) is referred to an abode in Burzakh.

The torment of dead believers due to their sins is revealed to the Prophet peace be upon him while his stay in Medinah. It is reported in Bukhari Volume 2, Book 18, Number 153:

*Narrated Al-Mughira bin Shu'ba: "The sun eclipsed in the lifetime of Allah's Apostle on the day when (his son) Ibrahim died. So the people said that the sun had been eclipsed because of the death of Ibrahim. Allah's Apostle said, "The sun and the moon do not eclipse because of the death or life (i.e. birth) of someone. When you see the eclipse pray and invoke Allah." Further, in the eclipse prayer khutbah, Prophet peace be upon him informed the believers about the Azab al-Qabr for Muslims. It is reported in Bukhari Volume 2, Book 18, Number 159 that:*

*Narrated 'Amra bint 'Abdur-Rahman: A Jewess came to ask 'Aisha (the wife of the Prophet) about something. She said*



to her, "May Allah give you a refuge from the punishment of the grave." So 'Aisha' asked Allah's Apostle "Would the people be punished in their graves?" Allah's Apostle after seeking refuge with Allah from the punishment of the grave (and thus replied in the affirmative). Then one day, Allah's Apostle rode to go to some place but the sun eclipsed. He returned in the forenoon and passed through the rear of the dwellings (of his wives) and stood for the (eclipse) prayer, and the people stood behind him. He stood up for a long period and then performed a prolonged bowing which was shorter than the first bowing. Then he raised his head and prostrated. Then he stood up (for the second Raka) for a long while but the standing was shorter than that of the first Raka. Then he performed a prolonged bowing which was shorter than the first one. Then he raised his head and prostrated. Then he stood up for a long time but shorter than the first. Then he performed a prolonged bowing but shorter than the first. Then he raised his head and prostrated and finished the prayer and (then delivered the sermon and) said as much as Allah wished. And then he ordered the people to seek refuge with Allah from the punishment of the grave. It is reported in Bukhari Volume 1, Book 3, Number 86 that:

*Narrated Asma: I came to 'Aisha while she was praying, and said to her, "What has happened to the people?" She pointed out towards the sky. (I looked towards the mosque), and saw the people offering the prayer. Aisha said, "Subhan Allah." I said to her, "Is there a sign?" She nodded her head meaning, "Yes." I, too, then stood (for the prayer of eclipse) till I became (nearly) unconscious, and later on I poured water on my head. After the prayer, the Prophet praised and glorified Allah and then said, "Just now*

*at this place, I have seen what I have never seen before, including Paradise and Hell. No doubt it has inspired me that you will be put to trials in your graves and these trials will be like the trials of Masiah-ad-Dajjal or nearly like it (the sub-narrator is not sure which expression Asma' used). You will be asked, 'What do you know about this man (the Prophet Muhammad)?' Then the faithful believer (or Asma' said a similar word) will reply, 'He is Muhammad Allah's Apostle who had come to us with clear evidence and guidance and so we accepted his teachings and followed him. And he is Muhammad.' And he will repeat it thrice. Then the angels will say to him, 'Sleep in peace as we have come to know that you were a faithful believer.' On the other hand, a hypocrite or a doubtful person will reply, 'I do not know, but I heard the people saying something and so I said it.' (the same). "*

From these ahadith, it is clear that the torment of the grave for Muslims is revealed to Prophet on the day of the death of his son Ibrahim. Ibrahim (son of the Prophet) died in 10 AH. It is reported that on his death's day, a solar eclipse occurred, which people thought occurred due to Prophet's son's demise. On that day the Prophet informed the Ummah about the trial of the grave.

Based on this evidence from Sahih Bukhari we would now analyze different narrations normally quoted in support of Azab al-Qabr in worldly grave.

Extension of grave of Abi-Salma (RA)

It is reported by Imam Muslim that a companion of Prophet Abi Salamh died and Prophet prayed for him

( ٩٢٠ ) حدثني زهير بن حرب حدثنا معاوية بن عمرو حدثنا أبو إسحاق الفزاري عن خالد الحذاء عن أبي قلابة عن قبيصة بن ذؤيب عن أم سلمة قالت : دخل رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم على أبي سلمة وقد شق



بصره فأغمضه ثم قال إن الروح إذا قبض تبعه البصر فضج ناس من أهله فقال لا تدعوا على أنفسكم إلا بخير فإن الملائكة يؤمنون على ما يقولون ثم قال اللهم اغفر لأبي سلمة وارفع درجته في المهديين واخلفه في عقبه في الغابرين واغفر لنا وله يا رب العالمين وافسح له في قبره ونور له فيه

*Umy Salama reported: The Messenger of Allah came to Abu Salama (as he died). His eyes were open. He closed them and then said: When the soul is taken away the sight follows it. Some of the people in his family wept and wailed. So he said:*

*Do not supplicate for yourselves anything but good, for angels say "Amen" to what you say. He then said: O Allah, forgive Abu Salama, raise his degree among those who are rightly guided, grant him a successor in his descendants who remain. Forgive us and him, O Lord of the Universe, and make his grave spacious, and grant him light in it.*

Abi Salmah died in 4 A.H. due to wounds afflicted in Uhud. This shows that the Qabr and its expansion were well known before 10 A.H. Further Abi Salamh was not yet buried but the Prophet prayed for his grave expansion, as if, Abi Salamah is already buried. This shows that the Qabr is the abode in Burzakh.

Saad bin Muaz and Azab al-Qabr ?  
A notable companion of the Prophet is Saad bin Muaz. He died due to wounds afflicted in Khandaq (5 AH). Scholars

who believe that soul is returned to the dead in the grave claim that the grave has squeezed Saad bin Muaz. (sunnan Nisai, chapter صُئَةُ الْقَبْرِ وَغَنَطُهُ)

أَخْبَرَنَا إِسْحَاقُ بْنُ إِسْرَاهِيمَ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا عُمَرُو بْنُ مُحَمَّدٍ الْعَنْقَرِيُّ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا ابْنُ إِدْرِيسَ عَنْ عُثَيْبِ اللَّهِ عَنْ نَافِعٍ عَنِ ابْنِ عُمَرَ عَنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ قَالَ

هَذَا الَّذِي تَحَرَّكَ لَهُ الرَّعْشُ وَفُتِحَتْ لَهُ أَبْوَابُ السَّمَاءِ وَتَمَهَّدَتْ سَبْعُونَ أَلْفًا مِنَ الْمَلَائِكَةِ لَقَدْ صَمَّ صَمَّةٌ ثُمَّ فُتِحَ عَنْهُ

*Ibn-Umer narrated that the Prophet's peace is upon him said: He is the person for whom the Throne moved and the doors of Heaven opened and seventy thousand angels visited and also indeed it (grave) squeezed then it (torment) is released.*

Sadly this narration is also reported by the same faction of scholars who believe in returning the soul to the dead as evidence of Azab al-Qabr. Saad bin Muaz, may Allah be pleased with him, was a glorious companion of the Prophet peace be upon him, If he had died due to wounds that afflicted him in war with pagans then he is a martyr, and Paradise would be his final abode. Chronologically speaking Prophet doesn't know about the Azab al-Qabr for Muslims before 10 A.H. then how could he say this? Therefore on these technical fallacies, this narration could not be accepted on the surface value.

Do dead hear the footsteps?  
It is reported in Bukhari that

حدثنا عياش حدثنا عبد الأعلى حدثنا سعيد قال وقال لي خليفة حدثنا ابن زريع حدثنا سعيد عن قتادة عن

أنس رضي الله عنه عن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم قال : ( العبد إذا وضع في قبره وتولي وأذهب أصحابه حتى إنه ليسمع قرع نعالهم أتاه ملكان فأقعداه فيقولان له ما كنت تقول في هذا الرجل محمد صلى الله عليه وسلم ؟

## عذاب القبر

فيقول أتهجد أنه عبد الله ورسوله فيقال انظر إلى مقعدك في النار أبدلك الله به مقعدا من الجنة . قال النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم ( فيهما جميعا وأما الكافر أو المنافق فيقول لا أدري كنت أقول ما يقول الناس . فيقال لا دريت ولا تليت ثم يضرب بطرقة من حديد ضربة بين أذنيه فيصيح صيحة يسمعا من يليه إلا الثقلين

*Narrated Anas: The Prophet said, "When the slave (of Allah) is laid in his grave and his companions went away, until, Indeed he hears the footsteps, arrive two angels to him and make him sit and ask him: What did you use to say about this man, Muhammad? He will say: I testify that he is Allah's slave and His Apostle. Then it will be said to him, 'Look at your place in the Hellfire. Allah has given you a place in Paradise instead of it.' " The Prophet added, "The dead person will see both his places. But a non-believer or a hypocrite will say to the angels, 'I do not know, but I used to say what the people used to say! It will be said to him, 'Neither did you know nor did you take the guidance (by reciting the Quran).' Then he will be hit with an iron hammer between his two ears, and he will cry and that cry will be heard by whatever approaches him except human beings and jinns."*

The interpretation of this hadith per the Quran is that the footsteps are that of angels, not the people who had just buried him. Al-Zain bin Al-Muneer الزَّيْنُ بْنُ الْمُنِيرِ said (Sharah Ibn-Hajar, juz 4 pg 401 )

وَكَأَنَّهُ إِقْتَطَعَ مَا هُوَ مِنْ سَمَاعِ الْأَدْيَمِيِّتَيْنِ مِنْ سَمَاعِ مَا هُوَ مِنْ الْمَلَائِكَةِ  
*And like hear from Angels (footsteps)  
like what (he used to) hear from humans' (footsteps)*

Also, Al-Muhlab said (Sharah Ibn-Battal, juz 5, pg 355) that word من يليه إلا الثقلين

(which approaches him except humans and jinns) means هم الملائكة الذين يلون فنته the angels which came for questioning. Therefore the only logical interpretation of this narration is that the dead hear the footsteps of angels, they question him and in case of a wrong answer torture it, and this cry is heard by angels themselves.

Unfortunately, the scholars who believe in returning the soul also claim that this narration is about the hearing of the footsteps of people, not of angels. However, they claim that Amr bin Abi Al-Aas's will is also following Quran i.e. When you bury me in the dust then wait on my grave, as much as, you slaughter a camel and divide the meat and I feel comfortable with you and see what shall I reply to angels of my Lord. The narration of footsteps and that of the will of Amr bin Abi al-Aas are both contradictory. One claims that the dead would hear when people who have buried it would be leaving, whereas, another one claims that the dead even knows who is standing at the grave and questions of angels are replied in the presence of people, who have just buried it!

Do all animals hear the Azab al-Qabr?

It is reported in Bukhari (also mentioned earlier) that Narrated 'Amra bint 'Abdur-

*Rahman: A Jewess came to ask 'Aisha (the wife of the Prophet) about something. She said to her, "May Allah give you a refuge from the punishment of the grave."*

So 'Aisha' asked Allah's Apostle "Would the people be punished in their graves?" Allah's Apostle after seeking refuge with Allah from the punishment of the grave (and thus replied in the affirmative). Then one day, Allah's Apostle rode to go to some place but the sun eclipsed. He returned in the forenoon and passed through the rear of the dwellings (of his wives) and stood for the (eclipse) prayer, and the people stood behind him. He stood up for a long period and then performed a prolonged bowing which was shorter than the first bowing. Then he raised his head and prostrated. Then he stood up (for the second Raka) for a long while but the standing was shorter than that of the first Raka. Then he performed a prolonged bowing which was shorter than the first one. Then he raised his head and prostrated. Then he stood up for a long time but shorter than the first. Then he performed a prolonged bowing but shorter than the first. Then he raised his head and prostrated and finished the prayer and (then delivered the sermon and) said as much as Allah wished. And then he ordered the people to seek refuge with Allah from the punishment of the grave.

Also reported in Bukhari (Volume 8, Book 75, Number 377)

حدثنا عثمان بن أبي شيبة حدثنا جرير عن منصور عن أبي وائل عن مسروق عن عائشة قالت : دخلت علي عجوزان من عجز يهود المدينة فقلتا لي إن أهل القبور يعذبون في قبورهم فكذبتهما ولم أنعم أن أصدقهما فخرجتا ودخل علي النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم فقلت له يا رسول الله إن عجوزين وذكرك له فقال لي ( صدقنا إنهم يعذبون عذابا تسمعه البهائم كلها ) . فما رأيته بعد في صلاة إلا تعوذ من عذاب القبر

*Narrated 'Aisha: Two old ladies from among the Jewish ladies entered me and said "The dead are punished in their graves," but I thought they were telling a lie and did not believe them in the beginning. When they went away and*

*the Prophet entered upon me, I said, "O Allah's Apostle! Two old ladies.." and told him the whole story. He said, "They told the truth; the dead are punished, to the extent that all the animals hear (the sound resulting from) their punishment." Since then I always saw him seeking refuge with Allah from the punishment of the grave in his prayers.*

The narration is a short version of what is reported in the long narration. The narrators have shortened many things. First, in the short version, it is reported, as if, Aisha may Allah be pleased with her was unaware of Azab al-qabr completely, in spite, of the fact that all verses related to Azab al-Qabr are already revealed in the Quran and from the context of this event it is clear that this incident took place in the year 10 A.H. In the long version, the situation is different, there the Jewess warned her against Azab al-Qabr and at that moment there was no information about the punishment of grave for Muslims as such.

The second issue is that the Prophet has immediately endorsed what Jewess had said although we know that there was a time lapse between the revelation of punishment of grave for Muslims to Prophet and this conversation of Aisha (may Allah be pleased with her) and Jewess. It is reported in Sahih Muslim chapter باب استحباب التعوذ من عذاب القبر

حدثنا هارون بن سعيد وحرمة بن يحيى ( قال هارون حدثنا وقال حرمة أخبرنا ابن وهب ) أخبرني يونس ابن يزيد عن ابن شهاب قال حدثني عروة بن الزبير أن عائشة قالت : دخل علي رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم وعندي امرأة من اليهود وهي تقول هل شعرت أنكم تفتنون في القبور ؟ قالت فارتاع رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم وقال إنما تفتن يهود قالت عائشة فلبثنا ليالي ثم قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم هل شعرت أنه أوحى إلي أنكم تفتنون في القبور ؟ قالت عائشة فسمعت رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم بعد يستعيز من عذاب القبر



*Narrated Aisha Entered (in the house) the Messenger of Allah peace be upon him and a Jewish woman was with me and She (Jewess) said have you ever realized that you would be questioned in graves? (Aisha) She said Messenger of Allah peace be upon him is horrified by this and said but Jews would be tormented She (Aisah) said after that lapsed some nights and then Messenger of Allah peace be upon him said Have you realized that I have been revealed in the graves? She (Aisha) said from then on I heard the Messenger of Allah peace be upon him seek refuge from the torment of the grave*

The words in the long narration in Bukhari ( After that one day) and narration in Sahih Muslim (after that lapsed

some nights) indicate that there was a time-lapse involved before the revelation of torment in the grave for Muslims.

Considering all these ahadith it is clear that narrators (of short narration of Bukhari) have shortened the long narration reported in Muslim and Bukhari and thus committed a mistake in understanding. On the other hand, this is the only narration in Bukhari that suggests that all animals hear the torment in the grave. If for a moment we assume that the dead are punished in graves in this world then this world is full of dead from Prophet Adam peace be upon him till today. Animals might be hearing the torture of the dead and for any moment hear the billions of cries, screams, and shrieks. Therefore as such it should be a norm for them however the following narration contradicts it completely.

### Did the mule hear the Azab al-Qabr?

It is reported in Muslim chapter

باب عرض مقعد الميت من الجنة أو النار عليه وإثبات عذاب القبر والتعوذ منه

حدثنا يحيى بن أيوب وأبو بكر بن أبي شيبة جميعا عن ابن علي قال ابن أيوب حدثنا ابن علي قال وأخبرنا سعيد الحريري عن أبي نضرة عن أبي سعيد الخدري عن زيد بن ثابت قال أبو سعيد ولم أنهده من النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم ولكن حدثني زيد بن ثابت قال : بينما النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم في حائط لبني النجار على بغلة له ونحن معه إذ حادت به فكادت تلقيه وإذا أقر ستة أو خمسة أو أربعة ( قال كذا كان يقول الحريري ) فقال من يعرف أصحاب هذه الأقر ؟ فقال رجل أنا قال فميتى مات هؤلاء ؟ قال ماتوا في الإنراك فقال إن هذه الأمة تتلى في قبورها فلولا أن لا تدافنوا لدعوت له أن يسمعكم من عذاب القبر الذي أسمع منه ثم أقبل علينا بوجه فقال تعوذوا بالله من عذاب النار قالوا تعوذ بالله من عذاب النار فقال تعوذوا بالله من عذاب القبر قالوا تعوذ بالله من عذاب القبر قال تعوذوا بالله من الفتن ما ظهر منها وما بطن قالوا تعوذوا بالله من فتنه الدجال قالوا تعوذوا بالله من فتنه الدجال

*Narrated Zaid bin Thabit: Prophet peace and blessings on him were riding a mule, moving along the wall of Bani al-Najjar and we (walking ) with him, that his mule shied and he (Prophet) was about to be demounted and there were graves of six or five or four (as stated by al-Jariri) so he asked who knows about people of these graves? One person said I know. He (Prophet) asked when they died. Said died in polytheism (as their belief) so Prophet said: Indeed this Ummah would be questioned in their graves as it is not (the case) that you would not bury your dead I call God to hear you from the torment of the grave, which I heard from them. He then looked at us and said Seek the protection of Allah from the torment of the fire we said we seek refuge with Allah from the torment of the fire, said Seek the*

*protection of Allah from the torment of the grave we said We seek refuge with Allah from the torment of the grave said Seek the protection of God from the temptations and hidden We said we seek refuge with Allah from temptations and hidden Said Seek the protection of God from Dajjal Fitnah we said We seek refuge of Allaah from Dajjal Fitnah.*

It is extracted from this hadith the torment was happening in these graves otherwise Prophet peace be upon him could not have said so. Before the discussion on this narration, it would interesting to remind the reader that Prophet himself had exhumed the pagans from the very site of Masjid un Nabi and destroyed the graves as mentioned earlier. Why he did that which would contract this report. The prophetic duty was to inculcate the fear of Allah in the hearts of his Ummah and these words only reflect that intention. Sometimes in Arabic, the negation is bought earlier to stress the importance of what would be said following as

It is reported in Musnad Abi Yala, juz 5, pg 248 that Prophet said:

فلولا أن لا تدافنوا لأخبرتكم بملككم من أهل النار حتى تفرقوهم ،  
عند الموت ، ولو أمرت أن أفعل لفعلت  
*it is not (the case) that you would not bury your dead I would have informed you about those who would fill into Hell Fire among you until you get separated (from them) on death if I had been commanded to do so I might have done so*

It is reported that Muslims would not bury the people of Hell among them if they knew about them. This narration shows that the torment in the grave has nothing to do with graves. Both narrations (of Muslim and Abi-Yala) start with the phrase فلولا أن لا تدافنوا but convey opposite

meanings. The phrase is thus not conveying that torment in graves occurs in the very grave of a person.

A similar style is present in Quran where Allah Almighty has instructed us that

فلا تموتن إلا وأنتم مسلمون  
*then die not except in the Faith of Islam*  
(2:132)

Ibn-Manzoor says in Lisan-al-Arab, juz 2, pg 90:

قال أبو إسحق إن قال قائل كيف ينههم عن الموت وهم إيمان ماتون؟ قيل إيماناً وقع هذا على سعة الكلام وما تكثير العرب استعماله قال والمعنى الزموا الإسلام  
*Abu Ishaq said if the inquirer asks, how one may escape from death and they have died (not themselves)? Said it occurs due to the extent of speech and is used extensively by Arabs in their language and meaning is made Islam compulsory*

**Putting green branch on the grave** It is reported in Bukhari, Book 8, Volume 73, Hadith 78: Good Manners and Form:

*Narrated Ibn 'Abbas: Allah's Apostle passed by two graves and said, "Both of them (persons in the grave) are being tortured, and they are not being tortured for a major sin. This one used not to save himself from being soiled with his urine, and the other used to go about with calumnies (among the people to rouse hostilities, e.g., one goes to a person and tells him that so-and-so says about him such-and-such evil things). The Prophet then asked for a green leaf of a date palm tree, split it into two pieces and planted one on each grave, and said, "It is hoped that their punishment may be abated till those two pieces of the leaf get dried."*

This narration doesn't prove that the punishment was happening in those



graves. The words are they are tortured. It is like if go and visit Cairo Museum and we see the mummy of one of the Pharoah and say that Allah has informed us that these were tortured in Hellfire. By these statements, no one would extract that Hell is somewhere in Cairo. Further, it is also reported that one day Prophet was sitting among his companions and suddenly they heard a loud voice. Prophet asked do you know where comes this loud voice. Companions said Only Allah and his Messenger peace be upon him knows about it. Prophet said it was the stone which is dropped in Hell seventy years ago, and now it reached its bottom. Does this show that Hell is somewhere near Medinah? Surely not!

The present treatise is only an effort to guide the reader towards the concept of Azab al-Qabr in the Quran and authentic ahadith. There is a plethora of weak narrations on this topic. Some of these narrations were concocted to inculcate fear of Allah in hearts and abhorrence from World, as claimed by the narrators. Interested readers may see the books written by Duafa (weak narrators), Majroheen, and Kazzab (liars).

As a Muslim, we must bring our beliefs following Holy Quran. May Allah send his blessings on our last Prophet Muhammad peace be upon him and guide us towards his mercy and Heavens and save us from Azab al-Qabr and Hell Fire. Amen