

HEARING OF DEAD

by

Abu Shahiryaar

2023

ISLAMIC-BELIEF.NET

HEARING OF DEAD

BY

Abu Shahiryaa

2023

بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ

الْحَمْدُ لِلَّهِ تَسْبِيحُهُ وَتَسْتَغْفِرُهُ وَتَعُوذُ بِاللَّهِ مِنْ مُرُورِ أَفْسِنَا مِنْ يَهْدِيهِ اللَّهُ فَلَا مَضِلَّ لَهُ وَمَنْ يُضِلُّ فَلَا هَادِيَ لَهُ وَأَشْهَدُ أَنْ لَا إِلَهَ إِلَّا اللَّهُ وَأَشْهَدُ أَنَّ مُحَمَّدًا عَبْدُهُ وَرَسُولُهُ

All the praise be to Allah, we seek his help and apologize to him and find refuge in him from the mischief of ourselves and whom Allah guided none can mislead him and whom he sent astray none can guide him and I witness that there is no God except Allah and that Muhammad is his slave and prophet.

Allah has informed his Messenger peace be upon him that (Al-Naml, 80)

إِنَّكَ لَا تَسْمَعُ الْمَوْتَى وَلَا تَسْمَعُ الصَّمَّ الدَّعَاءَ إِذَا وَلَّوْا مُدْبِرِينَ

Verily, you cannot make the dead to hear (i.e. benefit them and similarly the disbelievers), nor can you make the deaf to hear the call, when they flee, turning their backs.

It is told that these pagans of Makkah would not give heed to your call towards monotheism, as if, they are dead. After the demise of Taba-Tabbayeen this concept start mushrooming in the Muslims societies that their Prophet, Aulliah Allah(friends of Allah) and finally all dead Muslims can hear and even say reply to breathing humans on surface of earth. The people in grave are not really dead, as Prophet has commanded us to say Salam whenever we enter the graveyard and that prayer demands that these so-called dead people are living and have sense to reply to us. During the period of Mongol invasion on Muslims, this practice of calling dead and belief that the holy people are living in graves become so prevalent that a the then scholar Ibn-Tamiyah (728 A.H.) said in his Fatwa al-Kubra juz 3 pg 412

فَهَذِهِ النَّصُوصُ وَأَمثَالُهَا تُبَيِّنُ أَنَّ الْمَيِّتَ يَسْمَعُ فِي الْحِمْلَةِ كَلَامَ الْحَيِّ وَلَا يَجِبُ أَنْ يَكُونَ السَّمْعُ لَهُ دَائِمًا ، بَلْ قَدْ

يَسْمَعُ فِي حَالٍ دُونَ حَالٍ كَمَا قَدْ يُغْرَضُ لِلْحَيِّ فَإِنَّهُ قَدْ يَسْمَعُ أَحْيَانًا خِطَابَ مَنْ يُحَاطَبُهُ ، وَقَدْ لَا يَسْمَعُ لِغَارِضٍ يُغْرَضُ لَهُ ، وَهَذَا السَّمْعُ يَنْتَمِعُ إِذْرَابًا ، لَيْسَ يَتَرْتَّبُ عَلَيْهِ جَزَاءٌ ، وَلَا هُوَ السَّمْعُ الْمُنْتَفِي بِقَوْلِهِ : إِنَّكَ لَا تَسْمَعُ الْمَوْتَى فَإِنَّ الْمَرَادَ بِذَلِكَ نَتْمَعُ الْقُبُورِ وَالْإِمْتِثَالَ .

These evidences and similar show that the dead hear the living and it is not necessary that this hearing is permanent but it hears as the living can. It may sometimes hear the address of one who called . . . and this hearing is hearing with senses and not entails the hearing, Nor there is absence of hearing due to: you don't hear the dead, which intents the hearing of graves and similar.

This reflects that by the year 700 A.H., the concept of hearing of dead has become a well established belief of some of the Muslims. The same point of view is then followed by Ibn-Qayyam (d. 751 A.H.), Ibn Katheer (d. 774 AH) and many others. The earliest of Muslims do not believe in hearing of dead. It is reported in Tafseer Tibri, juz 20 , pg 459 that

حدثنا بشر، قال: ثنا يزيد، قال: ثنا سعيد، عن قتادة (إِنَّ اللَّهَ يَسْمَعُ مَنْ يَشَاءُ وَمَا أَنْتَ بِمَسْمُوعٍ مِنْ فِي الْقُبُورِ) كَذَلِكَ الْكَافِرَ لَا يَسْمَعُ، وَلَا يَنْتَفِعُ بِمَا يَسْمَعُ.

Qattadah said: (Verily, Allah makes whom He will hear, but you cannot make hear those who are in graves), like this infidel does not hear and what he hears would not help him.

Qattadah has indicated his belief that he does not believe in hearing of dead so he said likewise infidel does not hear. For scholars who believe in hearing of the dead, the narration of Badr Well is evidence.



Narration of Well of Badr

and its interpretation

It is reported in Bukhari Volume 5, Book 59, Number 314:

Narrated Abu Talha: On the day of Badr, the Prophet ordered that the corpses of twenty four leaders of Quraish should be thrown into one of the dirty dry wells of Badr. (It was a habit of the Prophet that whenever he conquered some people, he used to stay at the battle-field for three nights. So, on the third day of the battle of Badr, he ordered that his she-camel be saddled, then he set out, and his companions followed him saying among themselves." "Definitely he (i.e. the Prophet) is proceeding for some great purpose." When he halted at the edge of the well, he addressed the corpses of the Quraish infidels by their names and their fathers' names, "O so-and-so, son of so-and-so and O so-and-so, son of so-and-so! Would it have pleased you if you had obeyed Allah and His Apostle? We have found true what our Lord promised us. Have you too found true what your Lord promised you?" "Umar said, "O Allah's Apostle! You are speaking to bodies that have no souls!" Allah's Apostle said, "By Him in Whose Hand Muhammad's soul is, you do not hear, what I say better than they do." (Qatada said, "Allah brought them to life (again) to let them hear him, to reprimand them and slight them and take revenge over them and caused them to feel remorseful and regretful.")

Also reported in Bukhari that Volume 5, Book 59, Number 317: Narrated Ibn Umar: The Prophet stood at the well of Badr (which contained the corpses of the pagans) and said, "Have you found true what your lord promised you?" Then he further said, "They now hear what I say." This was mentioned before 'Aisha and she said, "But the Prophet said, 'Now

they know very well that what I used to tell them was the truth.' Then she recited (the Holy Verse):- "You cannot make the dead hear... ..till the end of Verse)." (30.52)

Ibn-Umer may Allah be pleased with him and Qatada both interpreted this incident as a special event. For them the hearing of dead is not a norm. Further this is the only incident of hearing of dead in which difference of opinion is reported between Ibn-Umer and Aisah may Allah be pleased with both of them. Ibn-Umer thought that this incident is special whereas Aishha said this speech was nothing but exhibit that the pagans got the knowledge of what Prophet used to tell them.

Al-Nawawi (d. 676 AH) views on this narration

Al-Nawawi (676 A.H) said in al-Majmoo juz 17 pg 224, that if someone quote the incident of well of Badr

قلنا تلك معجزة للنبي صلى الله عليه وسلم ، لان الله رد إليهم أرواحهم حتى يسمعون كلام النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم ، لان الاصل أن الميت لا يسمع .

We say it was the miracle of Messenger of Allah peace be on him, because Allah has returned their souls until they heard he speech of Prophet, as the reality is that the dead do not hear

Hafiz Ibn-Rajab (d. 795 AH) views on narration

It is quoted in book Al-Ayat al-Bayyanat by a recent scholar, Al-Bani that Ibn-Rajab said in his work Ahwal Al-Qaboor:

قال المحافظ ابن رجب: وقد وافق عائشة على نفي سماع الوقي كلام الأحياء طائفة من العلماء

Hafiz Ibn-Rajab said: and agreed with Aisha in negation of hearing of the dead a group of scholars

Al-Bani views on this narration

A recent scholar, Al-Bani said in Al-Ayat al-Bayyanat pg 48

قلت : ولذلك أوردته الخطيب التبريزي في باب المعجزات من
المشكاة ج ٣ رقم ٥٩٣٨

I (Al-Bani) say: and that is why Khateeb al-Tibrizi brought this narration in chapter on miracles in (his compilation) al-Mishkaat, juz 3, raqam 5938

So there were only two interpretations of this event. One group said that it's a miracle (like Ibn-Umer Qattadah) and other said that its knowledge (like Aisha peace be upon her). On the contrary some people extracted a third opinion from this (like Ibn-Tammiyah, Ibn-Qayyam, Ibn-Katheer, Al-Subki etc) that it is neither miracle nor knowledge but a norm. All dead people can hear. Some say time to time and some claim all the time.

Ibn-Katheer (d. 774 AH) view on narration of well of Badr

Ibn-Katheer (774 AH) said in his Tafseer juz 3, pg 579

وقد استدلت أم المؤمنين عائشة رضي الله عنها بهذه الآية

إنك لا تسمع الموتى على توهيم عبد الله بن عمر في روايته مخاطبة النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم القتلى الذين ألقوا في قليب بدر بعد ثلاثة أيام والصحيح عند العلماء رواية عبد الله بن عمر لما رواه من الشواهد على صحتها من وجوه كثيرة من أشهر ذلك ما رواه ابن عبد البر مصححا له عن ابن عباس مرفوعا [ما من أحد يمر بقبر أخيه المسلم كان يعرفه في الدنيا فيسلم عليه إلا رد الله عليه روحه حتى يرد عليه السلام]

And argued Aisah, mother of believers may Allah be pleased with her, from the verse Verily, you cannot make the dead to hear, on the confusion of speech of Messenger of Allah, to the killed ones which were thrown in the well of Badr, after three days But authentic among our scholars is the narration of Abdullah ibn Umer and it has many evidences due to there majority and famous among these is what had been

reported by Ibn-Abul Barr and authenticated by him, from Ibn-Abbas that When you pass by the grave of other Muslim bother which he used to recognize in the world and say Salam to him, he(person in grave) would reply to you

Person in grave is aware of the people walking outside his grave and even reply to salam?

A narration is reported with some changes as:

مَا مِنْ أَحَدٍ مَمَرٌ عَلَى قَبْرِ أَحَدٍ مِنَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ وَفِي رِوَايَةِ بَقَرِ الرَّجُلِ كَانَ يَتَرَفُّهُ فِي الدُّنْيَا فَيَسَلُّمُ عَلَيْهِ إِلَّا عَرَفَهُ وَرَدَّ عَلَيْهِ إِذَا مَرَّ الرَّجُلُ بِقَبْرِ يَتَرَفُّهُ فَيَسَلُّمُ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامَ وَعَرَفَهُ وَإِذَا مَرَّ بِقَبْرِ لَا يَتَرَفُّهُ رَدَّ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامَ
ما من أحد يمر بقبر أخيه المؤمن كان يعرفه في الدنيا فيسلم عليه إلا عرفه ورد عليه السلام.
إذا مر الرجل بقبر يعرفه فسلم عليه رد عليه السلام وعرفه وإذا مر بقبر لا يعرفه فسلم عليه رد عليه السلام

When you pass by the grave of other Muslim bother and say Salam he(person in grave) would reply to you

Narration attributed to Aisha

The narration from Aisha is reported by Ibn-Abi Dunya (ابن أبي الدنيا) in his book but it has narrator Abdullah bin Sama'an (عبد الله بن سمان) whose full name is عبد الله بن أبي زياد بن سليمان بن سمان, and who is a Kazzab (liar) narrator (see Tahzeen al-Tahzeeb, Al-Mezan al-Atedal).



Narration attributed to Abi Hurrairah Abu Hurrira's narration is also reported by Ibn-Abi Dunya which contains Muhammad bin Qudamah al-Jowhari and Hashsham bin Saad both are considered weak in hadith literature (see Mezan al-Atedal and Tahzeeb al-Tahzeeb)

Narration attributed to Ibn Abbas In Al-Istazkar (الاستذكار) by Abdul Barr, it is reported with sanad

قال حدثنا بشر بن بكير عن الأوزاعي عن عطاء عن عبيد بن عمير عن بن عباس قال قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم () ما من أحد مر بقبر أخيه المؤمن كان يعرفه في الدنيا فسلم عليه إلا عرفه ورد عليه السلام ()

Ibn-Hajar said in Taqreeb al tahzeeb, juz 1 , pg 646 . عبيد بن عمير مولى بن عباس مجهول من الرابعة . Similarly the narrator is Majhool بشر بن بكير (unknown). Allama-Alosi said in Rooh al-Ma'ani , juz 21, pg 57:

وقيل في حديث ابن عبد البر : إن عبدالحق وإن قال إسناده صحيح إلا أن الحافظ ابن رجب تعقبه وقال : إنه ضعيف بل منكر

Do dead hear the footsteps?

It is reported in Bukhari that

حدثنا عياش حدثنا عبد الأعلى حدثنا سعيد قال وقال لي خليفة حدثنا ابن زريع حدثنا سعيد عن قتادة عن أنس رضي الله عنه عن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم قال : (العبد إذا وضع في قبره وتولي وذهب أصحابه حتى إنه ليسمع قرع نعالهم أتاه ملكان فأقعداه فيقولان له ما كنت تقول في هذا الرجل محمد صلى الله عليه وسلم ؟ فيقول أنه شهد أنه عبد الله ورسوله فيقال انظر إلى مقعدك في النار أأبدلك الله به مقعدا من الجنة) . قال النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم (فيراهما جميعا وأما الكافر أو المنافق فيقول لا أدري كنت أقول ما يقول الناس . فيقال لا دريت ولا تليت ثم يضرب بطرقة من حديد ضربة بين أذنيه فيصبح صيحة يسمعا من يليه إلا الثقلين

And it is said for hadith (reported by) Ibn Abdul Barr: and indeed although Abdul Haque said its sanad is authentic but Hafiz Ibn-Rajab has tracked it and said: It is not only weak but Munkar narration.

Unfortunately scholar kept quoting this narration and state that it is authenticated on authority of Ibn-Abdul Barr. Finally one scholar spoke out (juz 1, pg 6298 فتاوى الإسلام سؤال وجواب)

فقد بحث أهل العلم عن هذا الحديث الملق فلم يجدوه مسندا في كتاب ، وكل من يذكره ينقله عن تعليق الحافظ ابن عبد البر ، فهو في الأصل حديث ضعيف ، إلا أن بعض أهل العلم صححه تبعا للحافظ ابن عبد البر الذي علقه و صححه .

Some reported this Muallaque (disconnected) narration which is not found

in connected state in any book, and all those who had quoted it had referred Hafiz Ibn Abul Barr, and in reality the hadith is weak. In fact this authenticated by some scholars as like Ibn- Abul Barr who had quoted it Muallaq (disconnected) and authenticated it.

Narrated Anas: The Prophet said, "When the slave (of Allah) is laid in his grave and his companions went away, until, Indeed he hears the footsteps, arrive two angels to him and make him sit and ask him: What did you use to say about this man, Muhammad ? He will say: I testify that he is Allah's slave and His Apostle. Then it will be said to him, 'Look at your place in the Hell-Fire. Allah has given you a place in Paradise instead of it.' " The Prophet added, "The dead person will see both his places. But a non-believer or a hypocrite will say to the angels, 'I do not know, but I

used to say what the people used to say!

It will be said to him, 'Neither did you know nor did you take the guidance (by reciting the Quran).' Then he will be hit with an iron hammer between his two ears, and he will cry and that cry will be heard by whatever approaches him except human beings and jinns."

Qattadah (d. 118AH) does not believe in hearing of dead but he reported that dead would hear the foot steps? A question arises whose footsteps are these. The interpretation of this hadith in accordance with Quran is that the footsteps are that of angels not the people who had just buried him. This whole session is executed in Burzakh. Al-Zain bin Al-Muneer () said (Sharah Ibn-Hajar, juz 4 pg 401)

وَكَأَنَّهُ اقْتَطَعَ مَا هُوَ مِنْ سَمَاعِ الْإِنْسَانِ مِنَ الْمَلَائِكَةِ

And like hear from Angels (footsteps) like what (he used to) hear from humans' (footsteps)

Also, Al-Muhlab said (Sharah Ibn-Battal, juz 5, pg 355) that word من يله إلا التفتلين (which approaches him except humans and jinns) actually mean هم الملائكة الذين يبلون فنته the angels which came for questioning. Therefore the only logical interpretation of this narration is that the dead hear the footsteps of angels, they question him and in case of wrong answer torture it and this cry is heard by angels themselves. Qattadah said (Sahih Bukhari, juz 1, pg 462) that

قال قتادة وذكر لنا أنه يفسح في قبره

We are informed that his grave would be widened

As seen above Qattadah does not believe in hearing of dead. He took the speech of Prophet at Badr's Well as a miracle of

Prophet and he also said that the grave is widened. If dead does not listen then how it would reply at the time of questioning. Further the widening demands seeing. It is therefore also clear from these narrations that according to Qattadah the questing and widening is not related to this grave in earth but rather it is executed somewhere else.

Some people claim that in the shorter version of this narration the angels are not mentioned and it is said that the dead hear the footsteps as people are departing. The scholar which do not believe in the returning of the soul of dead say against this argument that in Sahih Bukhari it is reported completely with chain

قال لي خليفة حدثنا ابن زريع حدثنا سعيد عن قتادة عن أنس رضي الله عنه عن النبي

In Muslim, Abi Dawood and Nisai the narration is shortened by the narrators who have heard from Yazid bin Zuraiy and Abdul Wahab bin Atta. It is always the rule that the complete version of the hadith would be used for understanding instead of the shortened version, done by the Shuyukh of Muslims and Abi Dawood.

Ibn-Tammiyah said in his Fatwah juz 1, pg 349

وَقَدْ تَبَّتْ فِي الصَّحِيحَيْنِ وَغَيْرِهِمَا أَنَّ الْمَيِّتَ يَسْمَعُ حَقْفَ نِعَالِهِمْ إِذَا وَقَلُوا مُدْبِرِينَ فَهَذَا مُوَافِقٌ لِهَذَا فَكَيْفَ يَذْفَعُ ذَلِكَ؟ وَمِنْ الْعُلَمَاءِ مَنْ قَالَ: إِنَّ الْمَيِّتَ فِي قَبْرِهِ لَا يَسْمَعُ مَا دَامَ مَيِّتًا كَمَا قَالَتْ عَائِشَةُ .

And this proved from Sahih Bukhari and Muslim and others that the dead body hears the footsteps of people returning and it is in agreement then how could it be repelled (i.e. ignored). And there are scholars which say : The dead in the grave do not hear, as long as it is dead, like (what) Aisah said



From the words of Ibn-Tammiyah it is clear that there were scholars who abhor the idea of hearing of dead and Ibn-Tammiyah counted Aisah, Mother of Believers among those scholars. Fa-zlullah bin Hasan al-Turbashti (661 AH) writes in Kitab al-Misabir fi Sharh Al-Masabeeh al-Sunnah on this hadith:

لما أشرنا إليه من دقيق المعنى ووضيح الكلام، وهو الأحق والأجدر ببلغة الرسول صلى الله عليه وسلم ولعل الاختلاف وقع في اللفظين من بعض من روى الحديث بالمعنى، فظن أنهما يتلان في هذا الموضوع من المعنى بمنزلة واحدة. ومن هذا الوجه أنكر كثير من السلف رواية الحديث بالمعنى خشية أن يزل في الألفاظ المشتركة، فيذهب عن المعنى المراد جانباً. قوله صلى الله عليه وسلم (لا دريت ولا تليت) هكذا يرويه المحدثون، والمحققون منهم على أنه غلط، والصواب مختلف فيه، فمنهم من قال: صوابه: لا أتليت ساكنة التاء، دعا عليه بأن لا تتلى إله. أي: لا يكون لها أولاد تتلوها، فهذا اللفظ على هذه الصيغة مستعمل في كلامهم، لا يكاد يخفى على الخبير باللغة العربية، فإن قيل: هذا الدعاء لا يناسب حال القبور؛ قلنا: الوجه أن يصرف معناه إلى أنه مستعار في الدعاء عليه بأن لا يكون لعمله نماء وبركة. وقال بعضهم: أتلي: إذا أحال على غيره، وأتلى: إذا عقد الذمة والعهد لغيره. أي: ولا ضمننت وأحلت بحق على غيره، لقوله: (سمعت الناس) ومنهم من قال: (لا اتليت) على أنه اتقتلت، من قولك: ما أوت هذا، فكأنه يقول: لا استطعت، ومنهم من قال: (تليت) أصله: تلوت، فحول الواو ياء لتماقب الياء في دريت. قوله صلى الله عليه وسلم (يسمعها من يليه غير الثقلين) إما صار الثقلان ١٩ ب عن سماع ذلك بمعزل لقيام التكليف ومكان الابتلاء، ولو سمعوا ذلك

Al-Khattabi (388 AH) commented on this in his Book of Gharib al-Hadith and Al-Baghwi said in Sharh-al-Sunan:

Salam for dead

It is reported in Sahih Muslim, chapter

: باب ما يقال عند دخول القبور والدعاء لأهلها

Narrated Aisah that Prophet instructed the Muslims to say prayer of blessings on their dead when they go to graveyard:

قَوْلُهُ: وَلَا تَلَيْتَ، قَالَ أَبُو سَلَيْمَانَ الْحَطَّابِيُّ: هَكَذَا يَقُولُ السُّحَدَاءُ، وَهُوَ غَلَطٌ

Khattabi said: Narrators said: وَلَا تَلَيْتَ and linguistically it is incorrect.

This shows that the narrators of Basra committed mistakes in narrating it, and there was an grave mistake of Arabic in the tradition. It is not possible that the error in Arabic comes from Prophet. This error in Arabic showed

that this narration was not reported exactly as said by the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him).

Many scholar have not considered this narration correct enough to be followed and among them is Imam Ahmed, who did not follow this narration of hearing of the sound of the foot steps and ordered that sandals be removed before entering the cemetery. Imam Ahmad's sons write in Kitab al-'Alal wa'rifa al-Rijal:

رَأَيْتُ أَبِي إِذَا دَخَلَ الْقُبُورَ يَخْلَعُ نَعْلَيْهِ فَقُلْتُ لَهُ إِلَى أَيِّ نَبِيٍّ تَذْهَبُ فَقَالَ إِلَى حَدِيثِ بَشِيرِ بْنِ الْخِصَاصِيَّةِ

I saw my father in the cemetery and taking off his shoes, so I said, "Why did you do this?" He said: "I follow hadith narrated by Bashir bin Al-Khassiyah."

This all shows that this narration of Shahib al-Bukhari is not accurately transmitted and not reliable enough among some of the haidth scholars.

السلام على أهل الديار من المؤمنين والمسلمين ويرحم الله المستقدمين منا والمستأخرين وإنا إن شاء الله بكم للاحقون

May blessings of Allah be on the homes of believers and Muslims, and may His mercy be on those who have departed early and on those who would come later and I will soon join you insha-Allah.

It is claimed by scholars Ibn-Katheer that this prayer is like an address, which indicate that the dead in graves would understand this and reply. On the contrary the group of scholars who believe that dead cannot hear, say that this is a prayer like we address but it does not mean that dead would hear as well. Note that this narration is reported by Aisha peace be upon her, and she did not believe in hearing of dead.

It is reported by Dahabi in Tahrikh al-Islam, juz 1, pg 642 that Ibn-Umer was informed about the arrival of Asma in mosque, after the crucifixion of Ibn-Zubair

وقال حميد بن زنجويه : ثنا ابن أبي عباد ثنا سفيان بن أبي عيينة عن منصور بن عبد الرحمن عن أمه قالت : قيل لابن عمر أن أسماء في ناحية المسجد وذلك حين قتل ابن الزبير وهو مصلوب فما ل إليها فقال : إن هذه الجثث ليست بشيء وإنما الأرواح عند الله فاتقوا الله وعليك بالصبر

It was said to Ibn ' Umar that Asma is in the mosque, while Ibn al-Zubayr was killed and crucified, so he said to her: that these corpses are nothing and indeed the souls are with Allah, so fear Allah and you have to be patient

Scholars who believe in hearing of dead then present this narration, reported by Ibn Abi Sheba, juz 3, pg 27

حدثنا عبيد الله بن موسى عن بن أبي ذئب عن قرة عن عامر بن سعد عن أبيه أنه كان يرجع من ضيعته فيمر بقبور الشهداء فيقول السلام عليكم وأنا بكم للاحقون ثم يقول لأصحابه ألا تسلمون على الشهداء فيردون عليكم

His father was returning from his farm, and he passed by the graves of the martyrs, said peace and blessings of Allah and we shall meet soon then he

said to his companions why don't you say salam to martyrs so that they respond to you.

In this narration the narrator is unknown. This is the only narration in

whole hadith literature with this chain and that makes this narration Gharib (isolated) and weak. Ibn Abi Zaib (159 AH) is although a siqa narrator but Ahmed said (Tahzeeb al-Kamal juz 25 pg 630) ابن أبي ذئب كان لا يبالي عن من يحدث Ibn Abi Zaib does not care from whom he is narrating. The purpose of visiting graveyard is to remind oneself the fact that one day we will be buried as well. But when we go to a graveyard then it is taught that we seek Salam (blessings) for the dead. According to sahih hadith, we may seek blessings for the Martyrs and it is not necessary to go up till their graves. It is reported by Bukhari in Volume 1, Book 12, Number 794:

Narrated Shaqlq bin Salama: 'Abdullah said, "Whenever we prayed behind the Prophet we used to recite (in sitting) 'Peace be on Gabriel, Michael, peace be on so and so. Once Allah's Apostle looked back at us and said, 'Allah Himself is As-Salam (Peace), and if anyone of you prays then he should say, All the compliments, prayers and good things are due to Allah: peace be on you, O Prophet and Allah's mercy and blessings be on you. Peace be on us an on the true pious slaves of Allah. If you say that, it will be for all the slaves in the heaven and the earth. I testify that none has the right to be worshipped but Allah and I also testify that Muhammad is His slave and His Apostle."



Would Prophet Jesus visit the grave of Prophet Muhammad

It is reported in Musnad Abi-Yalah (juz 6 , pg 84) that

حَدَّثَنَا أَحْمَدُ بْنُ عِيْسَى ، حَدَّثَنَا ابْنُ وَهْبٍ ، عَنْ أَبِي صَظْرِ ، أَنَّ سَعِيدًا الْمُقْبِرِيَّ أَخْبَرَهُ ، أَنَّهُ سَمِعَ أَبَا هُرَيْرَةَ ، يَقُولُ : سَمِعْتُ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ ، يَقُولُ : وَالَّذِي نَفْسُ أَبِي الْقَاسِمِ بِيَدِهِ ، لَيُنْزِلَنَّ عِيْسَى ابْنَ مَرْيَمَ - إِمَامًا مُقْسِطًا وَحَكَمًا عَدْلًا ، فَلْيَكْتُمِرَنَّ الصَّيْبُ ، وَلْيَقْتُلَنَّ الْحَنْزِيرَ ، وَلْيَصْلِحَنَّ ذَاتَ النِّبْتِ ، وَلْيَذْهَبَنَّ الشُّخَاءُ ، وَلْيَعْرَضَنَّ عَلَيْهِ الْمَالُ فَلَا يَقْبَلُهُ ، ثُمَّ لَيُنْ قَامَ عَلَى قَبْرِِي الصَّخْرَةِ ، فَقَالَ : يَا مُحَمَّدُ لأَجِيبَنَّهُ

Abu Hurairah said that I heard Messenger of Allah peace be upon him said: By Being (Allah) in whose hands the life of Abi Qasim (Prophet himself) is Indeed Jesus son of Mary would descend (from sky) as a fair and a just Imam. He would break the Cross and kill the pig, and rectify the relations and hostility would vanish and money would be offered to him but he would not accept it and then when he stands on my grave (for prayer of blessing he would say O Muhammad (and) I would reply (to him)!

This narration is reported by *أبي صَظْرِ حَمِيدِ بْنِ زَيْنَادٍ* who is a controversial narrator, some hadith scholars have endorsed his narration but others have rejected him as well. Ibn- Moin and Ibn- Addi called him weak narrator (Mezal al-Ateedal, juz 1, pg 612). Ibn- Shaheen called him weak (juz 1, pg 75), تاريخ أسماء الضعفاء والكذابين).

A similar kind of hadith is also reported by Imam Muslim in his Sahih with chain where it does not contains the addition (i.e. he stands on my grave and say O Muhammad I would reply). It is therefore an addition done by narrator Abi Sakhar *أبي صَظْرِ*

Do Prophet Muhammad hear from his grave?

It is reported by Dahabi in Mezan al-Atedal in discussion on narrator Muhammad bin Marwan:

العلاء بن عمرو الخنفي، حدثنا محمد بن مروان، عن الاعمش، عن أبي صالح، عن أبي هريرة - مرفوعا: من صلى على عند قبري سمعته، ومن صلى على نائيا بلغته.

Narrated Abu Hurraira: I hear the one who say Salam to me near my grave, and who say it far from me, his Salam is conveyed to me.

The narrator *محمد بن مروان* is a liar Dahabi says *ركبه واتبعه بعضهم بالكذب*. Narrations are not taken and some (scholars) have blamed him for lies. Uqaili said in Doafa Uqaili, juz 4 pg 136 after quoting this narration

لا أصل له من حديث الأعمش وليس بمحفوظ ولا يتابعه إلا من هو دونه

It has no source from Aamash and not a saved narration and no one else followed except those who are of similar kind

Ibn-Hajar said in Fathul-Bari juz 10 pg 243

وأخرج أبو الشيخ في كتاب الثواب آ بسند جيد بلفظ آمن صلى علي عند قبري سمعته ، ومن صلى علي نائيا بلغته

And Abu Sheikh has brought it in Kitab al-Sawab with good chain and with words I hear the one who say Salam to me near my grave, and who say it far from me, his Salam is conveyed to me.

It is stated in Aoon al-Mabood juz 4 pg 242

وأخرج أبو الشيخ في كتاب الصلاة على النبي صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم : حَدَّثَنَا عَبْدُ الرَّحْمَنِ بْنُ أَحْمَدَ الْأَعْرَجُ حَدَّثَنَا الْحُسَيْنُ بْنُ الصَّبَّاحِ حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو مَعَاوِيَةَ حَدَّثَنَا الْأَعْمَشُ عَنْ أَبِي صَالِحٍ عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ قَالَ قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ : آ مَنْ صَلَّى عَلَيَّ عِنْدَ قَبْرِِي سَمِعْتَهُ ، وَمَنْ صَلَّى عَلَيَّ مِنْ تَبَعِي أُبَلِّغْتَهُ ، قَالَ ابْنُ الْقَيْمِ فِي جَلَاءِ الْأَفْهَامِ : وَهَذَا الْحَدِيثُ غَرِيبٌ جَدًّا .

And Abu Sheikh has brought it in Kitab-al-Salat ala al-Nabi : (quoted sanad) .. Ibn-Qayyam said in Jilla al-Iffham and this narration is very Gharib

In Jila-al-Iffham the sanad is

وقال أبو الشيخ في كتاب الصلاة على النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم : حدثنا عبد الرحمن بن أحمد الأعرج ، حدثنا الحسين بن الصباح ، حدثنا أبو معاوية ، حدثنا الأعمش بن أبي صالح ، عن أبي هريرة

The word Ghharib indicate that no one else report this narration. As such there is no evidence that this narration is available to early scholars of hadith. A natural question is then why it is kept so secret that no one knows about this chain except Abu Sheikh ? Even Ibn-Qayyam who is an stalwart supporter of hearing of death said that narration is very Gharib.

Both in Jilla al-Iffham and Aaon al-Mabood the name of narrator is Hussian bin As-Sabah, who is an unknown narrator. Further Aamash has heard this narration from Abi Salah. Which Abi Salah is this? Aamash is Mudlis narrator and it is sometimes necessary to know from where Mudlish narrator has heard the report. Further the narration with use of عن from Mudlis narrator is not acceptable. Abu Zara' al-Dimishqui said (pg 230)

وأبو صالح الذي روى عنه الأعمش: سمع يوحنا أحمد بن حنبل وأحمد said and Abu Salah from whom Amash narrates (is) Sami

His name is Sami al-Ziyyat Al-Kofi. Ibn-Hajar (d 852 AH) said for him in Taqreeb al-Tahzeeb Maqbool مقبول من السادسة in sixth category. Sixth category contains the narrators which are lowest in authentication.

السادسة: من ليس له من الحديث إلا القليل، ولم يثبت فيه ما يترك حديثه من أجله، وإليه الاشارة بلفظ مقبول حيث يتابع، وإلا فلين الحديث.

Sixth: one from which there are very few reports of hadith, and it is not proved that his hadith would be rejected due to this and it is connoted with the word Maqbool when there is a support(ing narration) and otherwise weak-in-hadith

As this narration has no other supporting narration it would be necessary to reject it instead of taking it as an article of faith. Now some views about the book, from which this narration is reported. Ibn-Tammiyah said in Majmoo Al-Fatawah juz 1, pg 252 for Abu al-Sheik (d. 369 AH)

رواه أبو الشيخ الأصبهاني في كتاب فضائل الأعمال وفي هذا الكتاب أحاديث كثيرة كذب موضوعة

Abu Sheikh Al-Isbahani has narrated this in in book Fazail al-Aamal and in this book there are many narrations which are lies and manufactured narrations.

Dahabi said (Seer al-Allam al-Nubla juz 16 pg 279 علا تصانيفه بالوايات Filled his books with Wahyyat. A scholar of recent era, Al-Bani said(Al-Ayat al-Bayyenat pg 80)

وأما حديث من صلى علي عند قبري سمعته ومن صلى علي نائيا وأبلغته فهو موضوع كما قال شيخ الإسلام ابن تيمية في مجموع الفتاوى (٢٧ / ٢٤١) وقد خرجته في الضعيفة (٢٠٣) . ولم أجد دليلا على سماعه صلى الله عليه وسلم سلام من سلم عند قبره وحديث أبي داود ليس صريحا في ذلك فلا أدري من أين أخذ ابن تيمية قوله (٢٧ / ٣٨٤) : أنه صلى الله عليه وسلم يسمع السلام من القريب

And the hadith is concocted as said by Ibn Tammiyah in Majmoo al-Fatawah (27/241) and I brought it in Al-Daifa and I do not got the proof of hearing of Salam by Prophet near his graveand I do not know from



where got Ibn-Tammiyah that he said (27/384) Indeed (Prophet) peace be upon him hear the Salam when uttered nearby (his grave)

Further now in front of Prophet's burial place a verse is written:

يَا أَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا لَا تَرْفَعُوا أَصْوَاتَكُمْ فَوْقَ
صَوْتِ النَّبِيِّ وَلَا تَجْهَرُوا لَهُ بِالْقَوْلِ كَجَهْرِ بَعْضِكُمْ
لِبَعْضٍ أَنْ تَحْبَطَ أَعْمَالِكُمْ وَأَنْتُمْ لَا تَشْعُرُونَ

O you who believe! Raise not your voices above the voice of the Prophet (ﷺ), nor speak aloud to him in talk as you speak

aloud to one another, lest your deeds may be rendered fruitless while you perceive not.

The underlying belief is that the Prophet is alive in his grave and he is listening to what is happening outside of his grave. So it is instructed in Quran to call Prophet with dignity and respect and voices should be low. But this command was given for the life time of Prophet after his death he is no longer in this world but in the Jannat-ul-Firdous (Paradise). One must exhibit dignity and respect whenever his name is uttered but he is not at his grave.

What Fuqaha said about hearing of the dead?

An important issue in Islamic jurisprudence is that if someone took an oath that he would not talk to some person and assuming that this person is dead now and he goes to burial and talks to that person, then would that act annul his oath? Also if someone takes an oath that he would not talk to his friend and if he does so his marriage become invalid, now if the same person talks with the dead body of his friend then this would not annul his marriage.

It is reported in al-Mabsoot, juz 10, pg 407:

فَإِنَّ الْمُتَشَوِّدَ مِنَ الْكَلَامِ الْإِنْفَاهُ وَذَلِكَ لَا يَحْتَضِرُ بَعْدَ الْمَوْتِ
And the speech (to dead) requires the understanding and that is not possible after death.

It is reported in حاشية رد المحتار juz 4 pg 148:

وأما الكلام فلان المقصود منه الافهام والموت ينافيه
And the speech (to dead) requires the understanding and the death rules it out.

Al-Nawawi (676 A.H) said in al-Majmoo juz 17 pg 224:

وان كلمته وهو ميت لم تطلق، لان الميت لا يكلم.

And if he speak with it and he is dead, he would not be divorced as the dead do not talk

Also he said that if someone quote the incident of well of Badr

قلنا تلك معجزة للنبي صلى الله عليه وسلم، لان الله رد إليهم أرواحهم حتى يسموا كلام النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم، لان الاصل أن الميت لا يسمع.

We say it was the miracle of Messenger of Allah peace be on him, because Allah has returned their souls until they heard he speech of Prophet, as the reality is that the dead do not hear.

It is written in الفروع لابن مفلح juz 3, pg 348 that Ibn-Jawzi (597 AH) said

وَقَالَ ابْنُ الْحَوْزِيِّ فِي كِتَابِهِ التَّرْتِيبُ : الَّذِي يُوجِبُهُ الْقُرْآنُ
وَالنُّظَرُ أَنَّ الْمَيِّتَ لَا يَسْمَعُ وَلَا يُحِشُّ

Ibn Jawzi said in book Sir al-Mason: It is validated by the Koran and the consideration that the dead do not hear and sense



The final conclusion is that the hearing of dead is not a valid belief. It is against Quran and even Mother of Believer Aisha hold the belief that dead does not hear.

As a Muslim it is important that we bring our believes in accordance with Holy Quran. May Allah send his blessings on our last Prophet Muhammad peace be upon him and guide us towards his mercy and Heavens and save us from Azab al-Qabr and Hell Fire. Amen